

## TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT

TO:

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

CC:

MANAGER INFRASTRUCTURE CAPITAL WORKS

**COORDINATOR CONSTRUCTION** 

FROM:

**DIRECTOR ASSETS** 

FILE REF:

32969 19/340264

DATE:

**23 OCTOBER 2019** 

TENDER 19131: PROVISION OF MINOR WORKS FOR CASSERLEY PARK, GIRRAWHEEN, UPGRADE PASSIVE PARK

#### Issue

To consider Tender No: 19131 for the provision of minor works for the upgrade of passive park Casserley Park in Girrawheen.

#### Background

This project entails the development of Casserley Park, Girrawheen, in accordance with Local Planning Policy 4.3: Public Open Space. Casserley Park is a passive, local reserve located at 44 Casserley Avenue, Girrawheen, with a total land area of approximately 1.1 hectares, including a strip of land approximately 5m wide and 700m in length alongside Beach Road. The main part of the reserve is approximately 8000m2 and is listed for the purpose of public recreation. Casserley Park has only one other park located within a 400m radius walking distance that has been developed for recreational purposes.

#### Detail

Tender 19131 for the upgrade of Casserley Park, Girrawheen, was advertised on 3 August 2019 and closed on Tuesday 27 August 2019. No Addenda was issued.

Essential details of the proposed contract are as follows:

Item	Detail
Contract Form	Minor Works
Contract Type	Fixed Lump Sum Price
Commencement Date	October 2019
Contract Duration	Completion by 10 April 2020
Defects Liability Period	12 months
Extension Permitted	No
Rise and Fall	No

Tender submissions were received from the following:

Horizon West Landscape Constructions (Horizon West)

Landscape Elements (Landscape Elements)

Total Eden Pty Ltd (Total Eden)

Eighth St Pty Ltd T/A Ligna Construction (Ligna)

Menchetti Consolidated Pty Ltd, T/A MG Group WA (MG Group)

The Tender Evaluation Panel comprised:

A/Construction Coordinator, Landscape Designer, Specialist Parks Contracts, A/Coordinator Safety Systems.

## **Probity Oversight**

Oversight to the tender assessment process was undertaken by the City's Contracts Officer.

Tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan (PEP) which included the following selection criteria:

Item No	Description	Weighting	
1	Price (assessed under Value for Money)	Not Weighted	
2	Demonstrated Organisational & Key Personnel Experience	40%	
3	Methodology and Timeframe	40%	
4	OSH	20%	

Pricing is not included in the qualitative criteria and is considered as part of the overall value for money assessment. The minimum acceptable baseline for Qualitative Criteria is set at 50% with acceptable minimum scores required for each qualitative criterion.

On initial review of tender submissions, it was confirmed that all tender submissions were received as conforming tenders.

#### **Evaluation Criteria 1 Price (Not Weighted)**

Refer to Confidential Attachment for the overall lump sum price assessment. The fixed lump sum price (Schedule 1A) plus the selected optional items (Schedule 1B) were applied in the overall value for money assessment for Tenderers that met the minimum Qualitative Criteria requirements. Based on the preferred equipment to be installed in the new playground, items 7 & 9 have been excluded from the optional items in Schedule 1B.

# Evaluation Criteria 2 - Demonstrated Organisational and Key Personnel Experience (40%)

The tenderer's relevant experience in demonstrating the achievement of meeting client expectations as presented in their tender submission were assessed in order to evaluate their capability to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tendering entity's credentials to fulfil the requirements of the contract. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
MG Group	1
Horizon West	2
Landscape Elements	2
Total Eden	4
Ligna	5

## **Evaluation Criteria 3 - Tenderer's Methodology and Timeframe (40%)**

The tenderer's methodology and timeframe as presented in their tender submission were assessed in order to evaluate their capacity to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the capability of the tenderers in understanding the scope of work and demonstrating through their proposal that they had the ability to complete works within the specified timeframe. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Horizon West	1
Landscape Elements	2
MG Group	3
Total Eden	4
Ligna	5

## Evaluation Criteria 4 - Tenderer's Safety Management Systems (20%)

Evidence of safety management policies and practices was assessed from the tender submissions. The assessment for safety management was based on the tenderers' responses to an Occupational Health and Safety Management System Questionnaire included within the tender documentation.

All tenderers provided details of their safety management systems with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Horizon West	1
Landscape Elements	2
MG Group	3
Total Eden	4
Ligna	5

## **Qualitative Weighted Assessment and Ranking**

Tenderer's submissions were reviewed in accordance with the PEP with the following key observations:

- Price is not weighted and is included in the overall value for money assessment.
- The tenderers' submissions were evaluated in accordance with the selection criteria and were assessed against the necessary resources, previous experience, capability and safety and quality management systems to undertake the tender.

The qualitative weighted assessment resulted in the following tenderer ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Horizon West	1
Landscape Elements	2
MG Group	3
Total Eden	4
Ligna	5

Subsequent to the qualitative assessment being completed, Landscape Elements advised the City they had made an error in pricing and withdrew their offer.

Horizon West and MG Group achieved acceptable qualitative criteria results and progressed to the overall value for money assessment.

### **Overall Value for Money Assessment and Comment**

The tender submission from Horizon West achieved the highest qualitative criteria ranking and satisfied the overall value for money assessment as detailed in the PEP and is therefore recommended as the successful tenderer.

Refer to Confidential Attachment for further details relating to the overall assessment results.

#### Consultation

Extensive community consultation occurred in April and May 2019 as part of the concept and design development for this project. In accordance with Section 3.51 of the Local Act 1995 relating to minor construction works, general construction notice will be issued to adjoining properties and signage will be installed on site.

#### **Statutory Compliance**

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.57 of the Local Government Act 1995. The tendering procedures and evaluation complied with the requirements of Part 4 of the Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996.

#### Strategic Implications

The proposal aligns with the following objective within the Strategic Community Plan 2026 - 2027:

- 1. Society
- 1.1 Healthy and Active People
- 1.1.1 Create opportunities that encourage community wellbeing and active and healthy lifestyles.

#### **Enterprise Risk Management Considerations**

Risk Title	Risk Rating	
C0-023 Safety of Community	Moderate	
Accountability	Action Planning Option	
Director of Community and Place	Manage	

Risk Title	<b>)</b>				Risk Rating
C0-017 Financial Management			ent	Moderate	
Accounta	abilit	У			Action Planning Option
Director Performa		Corporate	Strategy	and	Manage

#### **Financial and Performance Risk**

#### Financial Risk

A financial risk assessment was undertaken as part of the tender evaluation process and the outcome of this independent assessment advised that Horizon West has been assessed as having a 'satisfactory' financial capacity to meet the requirements of the contract. Security in the form of unconditional bank guarantees will be required and payment will be on completion of work stages.

#### Performance Risk

The recommended Tenderer has more than 20 years' experience in the landscaping construction services industry while working with various local governments across Western Australia, including the recent delivery of projects for the City. In addition, the recommended tenderer presents no disputes and claims history.

## Social and Environmental Considerations

In consideration of the sustainable procurement requirements in accordance with section 15 of the City's Purchasing Policy, the tender was evaluated against tenderer's response to Schedule 3B Social and Environmental considerations, which support construction considerations specifically related to asset protection, recycling practices, and disposal of non-required material in accordance with industry best practice. Horizon West is a registered Priority Access employer.

# Broader Economic Impact Implications for the City of Wanneroo

The recommended tenderer response to schedule 3C demonstrated contribution in terms of labour and/or purchase goods which will directly benefit the local community. Horizon West are located in the City of Wanneroo, with 20 employees living locally.

#### **Policy Implications**

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of the City's Purchasing Policy.

### Financial (Budget) Implications

Based on the tenderer's lump sum, the historic quantity, types of construction works carried out and the capital projects program, a calculation was made to determine the total annual estimated value of the works for the contract period which is accommodated in the existing 19/20 capital works budget.

PR-2682 CASSERLEY PARK, GIRRAWHEEN

Description	Expenditure	Budget
Budget:		
Capital Works Program 2018/2019		\$25,750.00
Capital Works Program 2019/2020		\$250,000.00
Budget Variation (approved by Council 15 October 2019)		\$79,250.00
TOTAL		\$355,000.00
Expenditure:		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
Expenditure incurred to date	\$27,847.00	
Commitment to date	0	
Construction Activities	\$294,429.00	
Other items	\$15,000.00	
Contingency	\$16,500.00	
Total Expenditure	\$353,776.00	
Total Funding	5	\$355,000.00

#### Recommendation

That the Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.14 - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register for the awarding of tenders ACCEPTS the tender submitted by Horizon West Landscape Constructions for Tender 19131 for the for the Provision Of Minor Works For Casserley Park, Girrawheen, Upgrade Passive Park, at \$294,429.00 Fixed Lump Sum, including the main works and selected optional items.

SUBMITTED BY LANDSCAPE DESIGN & PROJECTS OFFICER		
SIGNATURE	04/10/2019 DATE	
REVIEWED BY MANAGER CONTRACTS & PRO	OCUREMENT	
SIGNATURE	24/10/19 DATE	
ENDORSED BY MANAGER INFRASTRUCTURE SIGNATURE	ECAPITAL WORKS  24/10/19  DATE	
RECOMMENDED BY DIRECTOR ASSETS		
SIGNATURE	28.10.19 DATE	
APPROVED BY CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER		
SIGNATURE	DATE	
huther information forthe	d - Refer 19/42980	