

TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT

TO: CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER
CC: MANAGER ASSET MAINTENANCE
FROM: DIRECTOR ASSETS
FILE REF: 42122: 22/85046
DATE: 30 MARCH 2022

**TENDER 21035: CLEANING – CIVIC CENTRE BUILDINGS 1 & 2,
 WANNEROO LIBRARY & CULTURAL CENTRE, AQUAMOTION AND
 ASHBY OPERATIONS CENTRE**

Issue

To consider Tender 21035: Cleaning – Civic Centre Buildings 1 & 2, Wanneroo Library & Cultural Centre, Aquamotion and Ashby Operations Centre.

Background

Cleaning services to City of Wanneroo building assets are supplied by Iconic Property Services under contracts 18074 and 18075 and are due to expire 30 June 2022. The available extension options will not be exercised by the City.

The specification was amended to include activities which fulfil the requirements of COVID-19 cleaning in each of the relevant environments. The scope of services includes four (4) individual major building asset locations, each of which is allocated as a separable portion within the Tender.

It is proposed to award separable portions as individual contracts with the intent of enabling a broader reach for prospective tenderers and including local small business operators. It is also considered to simplify the process whereby one or more separable portions may be adjusted due to a change of business operations, such as leasing. This separation also mitigates the City’s reliance on a single contractor for all cleaning services across the City.

Detail

Tender 21035: Cleaning – Civic Centre Buildings 1 & 2, Wanneroo Library & Cultural Centre, Aquamotion and Ashby Operations Centre was advertised on 16 October 2021 and closed on 9 November 2021. A non-mandatory site meeting was held at each of the locations on 27 October 2021. A total of six (6) addenda were issued in response to clarifications sought and which did not change the intent or scope of work included to the original tender document. Essential details of the proposed contract are as follows:

Item	Detail
Contract Form	Goods and Services
Contract Type	Schedule of Rates
Contract Duration	1 Year
Commencement Date	April 2022
Expiry Date	April 2023
Extension Permitted	Yes, four (4) x 12 months or part thereof
Rise and Fall	As specified in the Conditions of Contract

21035 - Provision of cleaning services to Civic Centre Buildings 1 & 2, Wanneroo Library & Cultural Centre, Aquamotion and Ashby Operations Centre

Tender submissions were received from the following companies:

Legal Name	Trading Name	Abbreviation
Facilities First Australia Pty Ltd		Facilities 1st
G.J & K Cleaning Services Pty Ltd	GJK Facility Services	GJK
Iconic Property Services Pty Ltd		Iconic
Intelife Group Ltd		Intelife
Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd	OCE Corporate Cleaning	OCE
Twin Cleaning Company Pty Ltd		Twin

The Tender Evaluation Panel comprised:

- Coordinator Building Maintenance
- Technical Officer Building Maintenance North
- Acting Technical Officer Building Maintenance South
- Facilities Specialist - Aquamotion
- Coordinator Safety Systems
- Technical Officer Asset Maintenance

Probity Oversight

Oversight to the tender assessment process was undertaken by an external Probity Adviser (William Buck Consulting (WA) Pty Ltd) in conjunction with the City's Contracts Officer.

Tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan (PEP) which included the following selection criteria:

Item No	Description	Weighting
1	Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement a. Environmental Considerations 5% b. Buy Local 15% c. Reconciliation Action Plan 2.5% Disability Access & Inclusion 2.5%	25%
2	* OSH Demonstrated Working Documents	20%
3	* Demonstrated Experience	25%
4	* Methodology and Availability of Resources & Capacity	30%

Tenderers must achieve a minimum acceptable qualitative score (as determined by the City) and for each of the qualitative criteria detailed above (*) to be considered for further evaluation.

Pricing is not included in the qualitative criteria and is considered as part of the overall value for money assessment.

All tenders were accepted on the basis that they were compliant and worthy of inclusion in the tender evaluation process.

21035 - Provision of cleaning services to Civic Centre Buildings 1 & 2, Wanneroo Library & Cultural Centre, Aquamotion and Ashby Operations Centre

Evaluation Criteria 1 – Sustainable Procurement (25%)

Evidence of Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement was assessed based on the Tenderers’ responses provided to the Questionnaires within Schedules 3A, 3B, 3C and 3D which formed part of the tender documentation.

Sub Criteria a) - Environmental Considerations (sub weighting 5%)

The City is committed to procuring goods and services that provide positive environmental, social and economic impacts over the entire life cycle of a product or service. Respondents are encouraged to provide credentials of any environmental claims of the goods and/or services submitted in this tender.

All tenderers provided adequate details of their environmental considerations within Schedule 3A, with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Facilities First Australia Pty Ltd	1
G.J & K Cleaning Services Pty Ltd	2
Intelife Group Ltd	3
Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd	3
Iconic Property Services Pty Ltd	5
Twin Cleaning Company Pty Ltd	5

Sub Criteria b) - Buy Local (sub weighting 15%)

An assessment was made based on the response provided, detailing the following information:

- Purchasing arrangements through local businesses;
- Location of tenderer’s offices and workshops;
- Residential addresses of staff and company addresses of subcontractors;
- Requirement for new employees arising from award of the contract.

All tenderers provided details of their “Buy Local” considerations within Schedule 3A, with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Twin Cleaning Company Pty Ltd	1
Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd	2
Iconic Property Services Pty Ltd	3
Intelife Group Ltd	4
Facilities First Australia Pty Ltd	5
G.J & K Cleaning Services Pty Ltd	6

Sub Criteria c) - Reconciliation Action Plan (RAP) (sub weighting 2.5%)

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to:

- RELATIONSHIPS - building positive relationships between indigenous and non-indigenous people;
- RESPECT – recognising the contribution of Indigenous people to Australia and learning more about the history, culture and diversity in a two-way communication process;

21035 - Provision of cleaning services to Civic Centre Buildings 1 & 2, Wanneroo Library & Cultural Centre, Aquamotion and Ashby Operations Centre

- OPPORTUNITIES – attracting, developing and retaining organisational talent to build opportunities for aboriginal employment, training, and development and mentoring.

All tenderers provided information specifying differing levels of actions in relation to indigenous reconciliation action with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Facilities First Australia Pty Ltd	1
Intelife Group Ltd	2
G.J & K Cleaning Services Pty Ltd	2
Iconic Property Services Pty Ltd	4
Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd	4
Twin Cleaning Company Pty Ltd	4

Sub Criteria d) – Disability Access & Inclusion Plan (AIP) (sub weighting 2.5%)

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to:

- People with disabilities having the same buildings and facilities access opportunities as other people;
- People with disabilities receiving information in a format that will enable them to access information as readily as other people are able to access it;
- People with disabilities receiving the same level and quality of service from staff as other people receive;
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to make complaints;
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to participate in any employment opportunities.

All tenderers provided information specifying differing levels of consideration for access and inclusion provisions with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Intelife Group Ltd	1
Twin Cleaning Company Pty Ltd	2
Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd	3
Facilities First Australia Pty Ltd	3
G.J & K Cleaning Services Pty Ltd	3
Iconic Property Services Pty Ltd	3

Overall Sustainable Procurement Ranking Summary

The following presents the overall Sustainable Procurement criterion ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Twin Cleaning Company Pty Ltd	1
Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd	2
Intelife Group Ltd	3
Facilities First Australia Pty Ltd	4
Iconic Property Services Pty Ltd	5
G.J & K Cleaning Services Pty Ltd	6

Evaluation Criteria 2 – OSH Demonstrated Working Documents (20%)

Evidence of safety management plans and policies defined in all tenderer’s submissions was duly assessed and the assessment of safety management practices was also based on the respondents’ responses to an Occupational Health and Safety Management System Questionnaire included within the tender documentation.

The tenderers were ranked as shown below under this criterion:

Tenderer	Ranking
G.J & K Cleaning Services Pty Ltd	1
Iconic Property Services Pty Ltd	2
Intelife Group Ltd	3
Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd	3
Facilities First Australia Pty Ltd	5
Twin Cleaning Company Pty Ltd	5

Evaluation Criteria 3 – Demonstrated Experience (25%)

The tenderers’ relevant experience in demonstrating the achievement of meeting client expectations as presented in their tender submissions was assessed in order to evaluate their capability to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of the tender submissions against this criterion closely examined the tendering entity’s credentials to fulfil the requirements of the contract.

The tenderers were ranked as shown below under this assessment criterion:

Tenderer	Ranking
Facilities First Australia Pty Ltd	1
Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd	2
G.J & K Cleaning Services Pty Ltd	2
Iconic Property Services Pty Ltd	4
Intelife Group Ltd	4
Twin Cleaning Company Pty Ltd	6

Evaluation Criteria 4 – Methodology and Availability of Resources & Capacity (30%)

The tenderers proposed methodology, capacity and available resources as presented in their tender submissions were assessed in order to evaluate their capacity to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment against this criterion considered the tenderer’s staff resources, vehicles, plant/equipment and approach to managing the contract.

The tenderers were ranked as shown below under this assessment criterion:

Tenderer	Ranking
Facilities First Australia Pty Ltd	1
Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd	2
G.J & K Cleaning Services Pty Ltd	3
Iconic Property Services Pty Ltd	3
Intelife Group Ltd	5
Twin Cleaning Company Pty Ltd	6

21035 - Provision of cleaning services to Civic Centre Buildings 1 & 2, Wanneroo Library & Cultural Centre, Aquamotion and Ashby Operations Centre

Overall Qualitative Weighted Assessment and Ranking

The overall qualitative weighted assessment resulted in the following tenderer ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd	1
Facilities First Australia Pty Ltd	2
Twin Cleaning Company Pty Ltd	3
Intelife Group Ltd	4
Iconic Property Services Pty Ltd	5
G.J & K Cleaning Services Pty Ltd	6

Value for Money Assessment

A calculation based on the City's estimated requirement for line items within each of the relevant Price Schedules was used to determine an equitable projected cost over the initial contract period. Further detail is contained within the attached Confidential Memorandum.

The combined assessment of Price vs Qualitative Scores on an overall value for money basis resulted in the following tenderer ranking for each separable portion:

Separable Portion	Recommended Tenderer
1 - Civic Centre Buildings 1 & 2	OCE Corporate
2 - Wanneroo Library & Cultural Centre	Intelife Ltd
3 - Aquamotion	OCE Corporate
4 - Ashby Operations Centre	Intelife Ltd

Overall Assessment and Comment

The tender submissions from Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd and Intelife Ltd respectively satisfied requirements in accordance with the assessment criteria and weightings as detailed in the Procurement and Evaluation Plan and are therefore recommended as successful tenderers for the nominated separable portions.

Consultation

The primary stakeholders within the City's Facility Operations and Aquamotion teams were engaged in advance of the process to ensure procurement arrangements fully meet operational requirements.

Statutory Compliance

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.57 of the *Local Government Act 1995*. The tendering procedures and evaluation complied with the requirements of Part 4 of the *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996*.

Strategic Implications

The proposal aligns with the following objective with the Strategic Community Plan 2021-2031:

“Goal 5: A well-planned, safe and resilient City that is easy to travel around and provides a connection between people and places.

Priority 5.3 - Manage and maintain assets

Wanneroo will be a City known for having high quality new and existing asset that are well-managed, maintained to be fit for purpose and valued by local communities. The City's assets will be future proofed by design and also provide maximum return on investment into the future.”

Enterprise Risk Management Considerations

Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-O13 Workplace Health and Safety	Low
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Corporate Strategy and Performance	Manage

Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-O22 Environmental Factors	High
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Corporate Strategy and Performance	Manage

Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-O08 Contract Management	Low
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Corporate Strategy and Performance	Manage

Financial and Performance Risk

Financial Risk

A financial risk assessment was undertaken as part of the tender evaluation process and the outcome of this independent assessment advised that Intelife Ltd has been assessed with a 'strong' financial capacity and Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd has been assessed with a 'sound' financial capacity to meet the requirements of the relevant contracts.

Performance Risk

An independent reference check for Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd indicates it maintains excellent working relationships, has satisfactory systems in place and provides a consistent quality of service to clients while maintaining alignment to budget and scheduling requirements without dispute or incident.

Intelife Ltd is the City's incumbent service provider for BBQ cleaning services and the contract manager from the City's Parks & Conservation Management team advises it is reliable and produces work to a high standard while maintaining alignment to budget and scheduling requirements without dispute or incident.

Intelife Ltd and Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd each advise they have not been involved in any disputes and/or received or issued any notices of default over the past 5 years.

Policy Implications

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of the City's Purchasing Policy.

Financial (Budget) Implications

The costs associated with the provision of cleaning services to Civic Centre Buildings 1 & 2, Wanneroo Library & Cultural Centre, Aquamotion and Ashby Operations Centre are included in the Asset Maintenance Operational Budget. The expenditure across all separable portions is estimated to be \$570,000 per annum. Further details are provided in the Confidential Memorandum.

21035 - Provision of cleaning services to Civic Centre Buildings 1 & 2, Wanneroo Library & Cultural Centre, Aquamation and Ashby Operations Centre

Recommendation:

That the Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.14 - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register for the awarding of tenders ACCEPTS the tenders submitted as per schedule of rates as follows:

Intelife Ltd	Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd
Separable Portion 2 Wanneroo Library & Cultural Centre	Separable Portion 1 Civic Centre Buildings 1 & 2
Separable Portion 4 Ashby Operations Centre	Separable Portion 3 Aquamation