

TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT

TO: CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

CC: MANAGER WASTE SERVICES

FROM: DIRECTOR ASSETS

FILE REF: 22/352979

DATE: 21 SEPTEMBER 2022

**TENDER 22106: TRANSPORT AND PROCESSING OF GREEN WASTE AND
SUPPLY OF MULCH**

Issue

To consider Tender No: 22106 for the Transport and Processing of Green Waste and Supply of Mulch.

Background

The City operates the Wangara Greens Recycling Facility (WGRF) for collection of clean green waste. Green waste is deposited at the WGRF through various activities:

- Community drop off;
- Bulk green waste verge collection; and
- Turf renovation and parks maintenance works (Parks Maintenance).

The City requires a suitably qualified and experienced contractor to transport the green waste from the WGRF and process it off site. Additionally, all green waste from turf renovation and maintenance activities requires collection from site and transportation to the WGRF (included in the green waste transported and processed off site).

The City's also requires shredded green waste (mulch) to be returned to the WGRF so it can be offered to residents when in possession of a free mulch voucher.

The current contract expires on 5 October 2022 with no extensions remaining. It is the City's intention to align the end date of this contract with Contract 20157 for Provision of Garden Organics (GO) Processing; allowing for all of the City's green waste to be transported and processed under a single contract into the future.

Detail

Tender 22106 for the Transport and Processing of Green Waste and Supply of Mulch was advertised on 13 August 2022 and closed on 30 August 2022. An addendum was issued on 25 August 2022, for the addition of a line item to Schedule 1 – Pricing Schedule.

Essential details of the proposed contract are as follows:

Item	Detail
Contract Form	Goods & Services
Contract Type	Schedule of Rates

TENDER 22106: Transport and Processing of Green Waste and Supply of Mulch

Item	Detail
Contract Duration	Nine (9) months
Commencement Date	6 October 2022
Expiry Date	20 June 2023
Extension Permitted	Yes, two (2) periods of 12 months, or part thereof
Rise and Fall	Maximum Perth All Groups CPI increases upon extensions.

Tender submissions were received from the following companies:

Legal Name	Trading Name	Abbreviation
Community Greenwaste Recycling P/L	Community Greenwaste Recycling	CGR
Craneswest (WA) Pty Ltd	Western Tree Recyclers	WTR

The Tender Evaluation Panel comprised:

Position Title	Evaluation Role
Manager Waste Services	Chairperson, Non-Voting
Project Officer Waste Services	Voting
Supervisor – WGRF	Voting
Technical Officer - Turf & Irrigation	Voting
A/Coordinator Safety Systems	Voting

Probity Oversight

Oversight to the tender assessment process was undertaken by the City's Contracts Officer.

Tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan (PEP) which included the following selection criteria:

Item No	Description	Weighting
1	Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement a) Environmental Considerations 5% b) Buy Local 10% c) Reconciliation Action Plan 2.5% d) Disability Access & Inclusion 2.5%	20%
2	*Work Health & Safety (WHS)	20%
3	*Experience	20%
4	*Capacity	20%
5	*Methodology	20%
6	Price (assessed under Value for Money)	Not Weighted

Tenderers must achieve a minimum acceptable qualitative score (as determined by the City) and for each of the qualitative criteria detailed above (*) to be considered for further evaluation.

Price is not weighted for evaluation purpose but is a consideration for an overall value for money assessment.

Both tender submissions were received as conforming and were included in the tender evaluation process.

Evaluation Criteria 1 – Sustainable Procurement (20%)

Evidence of Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement was assessed based on the Tenderer's responses provided to the Questionnaires within Schedules 3A, 3B, 3C and 3D which formed part of the tender documentation.

Sub Criteria 1a) Environmental Considerations (5%)

The City is committed to procuring goods and services that provide positive environmental, social and economic impacts over the entire life cycle of a product or service. Respondents were encouraged to provide credentials of any environmental claims of the goods and/or services submitted in this tender.

Tenderers provided adequate details of their environmental considerations within Schedule 3A, with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Western Tree Recyclers	1
Community Greenwaste Recycling	2

Sub Criteria 1b) Buy Local (10%)

An assessment was made based on the responses provided, detailing the following information:

- Location of tenderer's offices and facilities;
- Residential location of staff and locale of subcontractors' business;
- Purchasing arrangements through local businesses;
- Local employment opportunities or initiatives.

Tenderers provided details of their "Buy Local" considerations within Schedule 3B, with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Community Greenwaste Recycling	1
Western Tree Recyclers	2

Sub Criteria 1c) Reconciliation Action Plan (RAP) (2.5%)

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to:

- Creating opportunities that build and strengthen relationships with Aboriginal people;
- Demonstrating respect for, and promotion of Aboriginal culture and protocols;
- Increasing employment and inclusion opportunities for Aboriginal people.

Tenderers provided information in relation to indigenous reconciliation action with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Western Tree Recyclers	1
Community Greenwaste Recycling	2

Sub Criteria 1d) Disability Access & Inclusion (2.5%)

An assessment was made based on Respondents providing detail regarding how their submission can contribute to the achievement of some or all of the outcomes of the City's Access & Inclusion Plan (AIP).

Tenderers provided information in relation to access and inclusion with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Western Tree Recyclers	1
Community Greenwaste Recycling	2

The overall assessment of the Sustainable Procurement evaluation criterion has resulted in the following overall ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Community Greenwaste Recycling	1
Western Tree Recyclers	2

Evaluation Criteria 2 - Work Health & Safety (20%)

Evidence of safety management policies and practices was assessed from the tender submissions. The assessment for safety management was based on the tenderers' responses to a Work Health and Safety Management System Questionnaire included within the tender documentation.

Tenderers provided details of their safety management systems with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Western Tree Recyclers	1
Community Greenwaste Recycling	2

Evaluation Criteria 3 - Experience (20%)

The tenderer's relevant experience in demonstrating the achievement of meeting client expectations as presented in their tender submission were assessed in order to evaluate their capability to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tendering entity's credentials to fulfil the requirements of the contract. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Western Tree Recyclers	1
Community Greenwaste Recycling	2

Evaluation Criteria 4 - Capacity (20%)

The tenderer's resources as presented in their tender submission were assessed in order to evaluate their capacity to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tenderer's staff resources, vehicles, plant/equipment and workshop support to manage the contract. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Western Tree Recyclers	1
Community Greenwaste Recycling	2

Evaluation Criteria 5 - Methodology (20%)

The tenderer's methodology as presented in their tender submission were assessed in order to evaluate their capacity to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tenderer's understanding of the scope and ability to provide a suitable and detailed method for delivering the requirements of the contract. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Western Tree Recyclers	1
Community Greenwaste Recycling	2

Overall Qualitative Weighted Assessment and Ranking

Tenderer's submissions were reviewed in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan with the following key observations:

The response from both tenderers regarding their Experience and Capacity to provide the required services were substantial and of a good standard. The recommended tenderer however, provided a comprehensive and superior response to the Methodology criteria. Overall the recommended tenderer provided a more substantial response.

The overall qualitative weighted assessment resulted in the following tenderer ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Western Tree Recyclers	1
Community Greenwaste Recycling	2

Pricing for the Goods/Services/Works Offered

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the schedule of rates provided with the tender documentation. Refer to the Confidential Attachment for further information relating to the price.

Based on the information provided, tenderers are ranked as follows:

Tenderer	Ranking
Western Tree Recyclers	1
Community Greenwaste Recycling	2

Value for Money Assessment

The combined assessment of Price vs Qualitative Scores resulted in the following tender ranking (highest to lowest):

Tenderer	Ranking
Western Tree Recyclers	1
Community Greenwaste Recycling	2

Overall Assessment and Comment

The tender submission from Western Tree Recyclers satisfied the overall value for money assessment in accordance with the assessment criteria and weightings as detailed in the Procurement and Evaluation Plan and is therefore recommended as the successful tenderer.

Consultation

Nil

Statutory Compliance

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.57 of the *Local Government Act 1995*. The tendering procedures and evaluation complied with the requirements of Part 4 of the *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996*.

Strategic Implications

The proposal aligns with the following objective with the Strategic Community Plan 2021-2031:

Goal 4: *A sustainable City that balances the relationship between urban growth and the environment*

Priority 4.4: Manage waste and its impacts.

Enterprise Risk Management Considerations

Risk Title	Risk Rating
IN-O11 Waste Service Delivery	Low
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Manager Waste Services	Manage
Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-O22 Environmental Management	Moderate
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Planning and Sustainability	Manage
Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-O17 Financial Management	Moderate
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Corporate Strategy and Performance	Manage

Financial and Performance Risk

Financial Risk

A financial risk assessment was undertaken as part of the tender evaluation process and the outcome of this independent assessment advised that Craneswest (WA) Pty Ltd t/as Western Tree Recyclers has been assessed with a 'strong' financial capacity to meet the requirements of the contract.

Performance Risk

Western Tree Recyclers has held the contract with the City for these services since 2014 and has provided a high level of service without dispute or incident.

TENDER 22106: Transport and Processing of Green Waste and Supply of Mulch

Policy Implications

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of the City's Purchasing Policy.

Financial (Budget) Implications

The costs associated with Tender 22106, for the Transport and Processing of Green Waste and Supply of Mulch are included in the Waste Services Operational Budget for 2022-2023.

Recommendation:

That the Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.14 - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register for the awarding of tenders ACCEPTS the tender submitted by Craneswest (WA) Pty Ltd t/as Western Tree Recyclers for Tender 22106, for the Transport and Processing of Green Waste and Supply of Mulch, as per the schedule of rates in the tender submission.