

TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT

TO: CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

CC: MANAGER INFRASTRUCTURE CAPITAL WORKS
COORDINATOR CONSTRUCTION

FROM: DIRECTOR ASSETS

FILE REF: 46508: 23/239101

DATE: 27 July 2023

**TENDER 23061 SUPPLY AND INSTALLATION OF FOOTPATH LIGHTING
BROADVIEW PARK, LANDSDALE**

Issue

To consider Tender No: 23061 for the supply and installation of new footpath lighting at Broadview Park, Landsdale.

Background

The lights at Broadview Park, Landsdale have reached the end of their cost-effective operating life requiring replacement and upgrading to current standards. Administration have received complaints regarding the aging lighting infrastructure.

Detail

Tender 23061 for the supply and installation of new footpath lighting at Broadview Park, Landsdale was advertised on 3 June 2023 and closed on 11 July 2023. One addendum was issued to correct a typographical error.

Essential details of the proposed contract are as follows:

Item	Detail
Contract Form	Minor Works
Contract Type	Lump Sum
Contract Duration	6 Months
Commencement Date	Work to commence in January 2024
Expiry Date	June 2024
Extension Permitted	No

Tender submissions were received from the following companies:

Legal Name	Trading Name	Abbreviation
CCW WA Pty Ltd	CCW WA	CCW
Gillmore Electrical Services Pty Ltd	Gillmore Electrical Services	Gillmore
Greenlite Electrical Contractors Pty Ltd	Greenlite Electrical Contractors	Greenlite

Stiles Communications Services Pty Ltd	Electrical &	Stiles Communications Services	Electrical &	Stiles
---	-----------------	-----------------------------------	-----------------	--------

Probity Oversight

Oversight to the tender assessment process was undertaken by the City's Contracts Officer.

Tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan (PEP) which included the following selection criteria:

Item No	Description	Weighting
1	Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement a. Environmental Considerations 5% b. Buy Local 10% c. Reconciliation Action Plan 2.5% d. Disability Access and Inclusion 2.5%	20%
2	*Work Health & Safety (WHS)	20%
3	*Demonstrated experience in the provision of similar works for relevant personnel and organisation with achievement of client expectations	30%
4	*Demonstrated understanding of the methodology to deliver the works and the allocation of sufficient resources to undertake the works	30%

All tenderers must meet the City's minimum requirements (as determined by the City) for each of the qualitative criteria detailed above (*) in order to be considered for further evaluation.

Pricing is not included in the qualitative criteria and is considered as part of the overall value for money assessment.

All submissions were deemed as conforming and proceeded for evaluation.

Evaluation Criteria 1 – Sustainable Procurement (20%)

Evidence of Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement was assessed based on the Tenderer's responses provided to the Questionnaires within Schedules 3A, 3B, 3C and 3D which formed part of the tender documentation.

Sub Criteria a) Environmental Considerations (5%)

The City is committed to procuring goods and services that provide positive environmental, social and economic impacts over the entire life cycle of a product or service. Respondents are encouraged to provide credentials of any environmental claims of the goods and/or services submitted in this tender.

Tenderers provided details of their environmental considerations within Schedule 3A, with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Gillmore	1
CCW	2
Greenlite	3
Stiles	4

Sub Criteria b) Buy Local (10%)

An assessment was made based on the response provided, detailing the following information:

- Location of tenderer’s offices and workshops;
- Residential addresses of staff and company addresses of subcontractors;
- Purchasing arrangements through local businesses;
- Requirement for new employees arising from award of the contract.

Tenderers provided details of their “Buy Local” considerations within Schedule 3B, with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Greenlite	1
Stiles	1
Gillmore	1
CCW	4

Sub Criteria c) Reconciliation Action Plan (RAP) (2.5%)

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to:

- RELATIONSHIPS - building positive relationships between indigenous and non-indigenous people;
- RESPECT – recognising the contribution of Indigenous people to Australia and learning more about the history, culture and diversity in a two-way communication process;
- OPPORTUNITIES – attracting, developing, and retaining organisational talent to build opportunities for aboriginal employment, training, and development and mentoring.

Tenderers provided information specifying differing levels of actions in relation to indigenous reconciliation action with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
CCW	1
Greenlite	2
Stiles	2
Gillmore	4

Sub Criteria d) Access & Inclusion Plan (AIP) (2.5%)

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to:

- People with disabilities having the same buildings and facilities access opportunities as other people;
- People with disabilities receiving information in a format that will enable them to access information as readily as other people are able to access it;
- People with disabilities receiving the same level and quality of service from staff as other people receive;
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to make complaints;
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to participate in any employment opportunities.

Tenderers provided information specifying considerations for access and inclusion provisions with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Greenlite	1
CCW	2
Stiles	3
Gillmore	4

Overall Sustainable Procurement Ranking Summary

The overall assessment of the Sustainable Procurement criteria has resulted in the following overall ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Greenlite	1
Stiles	2
Gillmore	3
CCW	4

Evaluation Criteria 2 - Tenderer’s Safety Management Systems (20%)

Evidence of WHS management policies and practices was assessed from the tender submissions. The assessment for safety management was based on the tenderer’s responses to a specific Questionnaire included within the tender documentation.

Tenderers provided details of their safety management systems with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Greenlite	1
Stiles	1
Gillmore	3
CCW	4

Evaluation Criteria 3 - Tenderer’s relevant experience with achievement of meeting client expectations (30%)

The tenderer’s relevant experience in demonstrating the achievement of meeting client expectations as presented in their tender submission were assessed to evaluate their capability to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tendering entity’s credentials to fulfil the requirements of the contract. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Greenlite	1
Stiles	1
Gillmore	3
CCW	4

Evaluation Criteria 4 - Tenderer’s methodology, resources, and capacity to meet the requirements of the Contract (30%)

The tenderer’s resources as presented in their tender submission were assessed to evaluate their capacity to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tenderer’s staff resources, vehicles, plant/equipment, and workshop support to manage the contract. It also assessed their proposed methodology to complete the works. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Greenlite	1
Stiles	2
Gillmore	3
CCW	4

Overall Qualitative Weighted Assessment and Ranking

Tenderer’s submissions were reviewed in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan. The overall assessment of qualitative weighted criteria resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Greenlite	1
Stiles	2
Gillmore	3
CCW	4

Pricing for the Goods/Services/Works Offered

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the lump sum pricing provided with the tender documentation.

Based on the information provided, tenderers are ranked as follows:

Tenderer	Ranking
Stiles	1
Greenlite	2
Gillmore	3
CCW	4

Value for Money Assessment

The combined assessment of Price vs Qualitative Scores resulted in the following tender ranking (highest to lowest):

Tenderer	Ranking
Stiles	1
Greenlite	2
Gillmore	3
CCW	4

Overall Assessment and Comment

The tender submission from Stiles satisfied the overall value for money assessment in accordance with the assessment criteria and weightings as detailed in the Procurement and Evaluation Plan and is therefore recommended as the successful tenderer.

Consultation

It was determined by the Community engagement plan that no consultation was needed. This is a renewal of existing facilities. The public is to be informed so that they are aware of the replacement and possible limited access throughout the park during construction.

Statutory Compliance

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.57 of the *Local Government Act 1995*. The tendering procedures and evaluation complied with the requirements of Part 4 of the *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996*.

Strategic Implications

The proposal aligns with the following objective with the Strategic Community Plan 2021-2031:

GOAL # 5

'A Well Planned, Safe and Resilient City That Is Easy To Travel Around And Provides A Connection Between People And Places'

Priority 5.5

People feel safe in public places Wanneroo will be a City where people feel safe, and are able to live actively and recreate freely. Local agencies and groups will be at the heart of developing programs to create more connected communities, ensuring all people feel supported and secure.

Risk Appetite Statement

In pursuit of strategic objective goal 5, we will accept a medium level of risk, extended to High in the areas of Community / Reputation & Financial / Commercial impacts. Shifting transport modes and usage in the City may require short term pain for longer term gain as the City supports the development, maintenance and connection of alternatives to car use (e.g. cycle ways) and the supporting infrastructure.

Enterprise Risk Management Considerations

Risk Title	Risk Rating	Accountability	Action Planning Option
CO-O13 Workplace Health and Safety	Moderate	Director Community and Place	Manage
CO-O08 Contract Management	Moderate	Director Corporate Strategy and Performance	Manage
CO-O15 Project Management	Moderate	Director Assets	Manage

Financial and Performance Risk

Financial Risk

A recent financial risk assessment resulted in Stiles being assessed with a 'Strong' financial capacity to meet the requirements of the contract.

Performance Risk

Stiles Electrical successfully delivered electrical construction services while working with various local governments across Western Australia, including previous projects with the City. In addition, the recommended respondent has no disputes and claims history as stated in the submission.

Previous independent reference checks have also indicated that the recommended tenderer has a strong track record of working with local government for more than 5 years.

Policy Implications

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of the City's Purchasing Policy.

Financial (Budget) Implications

PR-4415 Broadview Park, Landsdale, Renew Pathway Lighting		
Description	Expenditure	Budget
Budget: 23/24		\$280,000.00
Expenditure:		
Expenditure incurred to date	\$0	
Commitment to date	\$0	
Project Management	\$14,000.00	
Tender Advertisements (Tender and Public Notices)	\$380.79	
Construction Activities (this Tender)	\$211,293.40	
Other Works	\$5,529.5	
- FOCUS Post construction Certification		
- Directional Drilling		
- FOCUS Audit and Inspection		
Construction contingency	\$48,796.31	
Total	\$280,000.00	\$280,000.00
Additional Funding Provision required in 2023/2024	\$0	

Recommendation:

That the Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.13 - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register for the awarding of tenders ACCEPTS the tender submitted by Stiles Electrical & Communication Services Pty Ltd for Tender 23061, for the Supply and Installation of Footpath Lighting at Broadview Park for the fixed Lump Sum of \$211,293.40.