

TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT

TO: ACTING CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

**CC: PROJECT MANAGER – COASTAL
PRINCIPAL COASTAL ENGINEER
MANAGER ASSET MAINTENANCE**

FROM: DIRECTOR ASSETS

FILE REF: 35991V02 23/320816

DATE: 18 SEPTEMBER 2023

TENDER 23148: NORTHERN BEACHES COASTAL SURVEYS

Issue

To consider Tender No: 23148 for the Provision of Coastal Surveys Across the Northern Beaches.

Background

The City of Wanneroo has been undertaking Aerial Surveys of the City's coastline for the past five years. Aerial surveys allow the City to quantify seasonal, annual and long-term changes to the City's beach volumes and assess the condition of our coastal structures. Understanding changes in beach volumes allows the City to proactively manage our coastline by identifying areas subject to significant erosion. The City's contract for the capture of aerial surveys expired in May 2023.

The Northern Beaches Alliance (NBA) was formed in 2022 to share knowledge and discuss coastal management issues across the Perth Metropolitan Area's northern local governments. The NBA includes the City of Wanneroo, City of Joondalup, City of Stirling, Town of Cambridge, City of Nedlands and the Shire of Gingin.

To enable effective analysis of seasonal and long-term changes of the coastline across Local Government Area (LGA) boundaries, the NBA are looking to capture consistent coastal survey data across the following Local Government Areas:

- City of Wanneroo;
- City of Joondalup;
- City of Stirling;
- Town of Cambridge;
- City of Nedlands; and
- Shire of Gingin

In July 2023 the NBA received grant funding from the Department of Transport (DoT) to undertake aerial coastal surveys across the LGA boundaries in October 2023 and April 2024.

The City of Wanneroo, of behalf of the NBA, issued a Request for Tender (RFT) for the capture of topographic aerial surveys and nearshore survey transects across the aforementioned LGA boundaries. The RFT was advertised as a three-year contract with the City of Wanneroo, with separable portions for the capture of coastal surveys across the other five LGAs. This contract will primarily act as a contract between the survey contractor and the City of Wanneroo for the collection of coastal surveys along the City of Wanneroo coastline. However, separable portions have been included in the contract which allows for the Project Site to be expanded to include any combination of the City of Joondalup, City of Stirling, Town of Cambridge, City of Nedlands, and Shire of Gingin coastlines subject to an annual Deed of Agreement signed by all parties. The Project Site will be confirmed at the beginning of each financial year and is subject to each LGA's willingness to participate in survey capture and external funding opportunities.

A Deed of Agreement for 2023/24 has been drafted with the City's Governance and Legal Team and will be signed by all parties following award of the contract and prior to confirmation of the Project Site. This Agreement will outline survey payment requirements for all participating LGAs, under the City of Wanneroo managed survey contract, and will be renewed each financial year following confirmation from each LGA. The City of Wanneroo will manage payments to the survey contractor and will issue invoices to all participating LGAs following the capture of the surveys. The Draft Deed of Agreement is referenced within the Confidential Memorandum.

Detail

Tender 23148 for the Provision of Coastal Surveys Across the Northern Beaches was advertised on 12 August 2023 and closed on 29 August 2023. Addendum 1 was issued on 21 August 2023 for the provision of further information on coastal survey boundaries.

Essential details of the proposed contract are as follows:

Item	Detail
Contract Form	Goods and/or Services
Contract Type	Fixed Lump Sum
Contract Duration	3 years
Commencement Date	September 2023
Expiry Date	September 2026
Extension Permitted	Yes, 2 periods of 12 months

Tender submissions were received from the following companies:

Legal Name	Trading Name	Abbreviation
BCE Surveying Pty Ltd	BCE Surveying Pty Ltd	BCE Surveying
Fugro Australia Pty Ltd	Fugro	Fugro
Marine & Earth Sciences Pty Ltd	Marine & Earth Sciences Pty Ltd	Marine & Earth Sciences

McMullen Nolan Group Pty Ltd	McMullen Nolan Group	MNG Surveys
------------------------------	----------------------	-------------

Probity Oversight

Oversight to the tender assessment process was undertaken by the City's Contracts Officer.

Tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan (PEP) which included the following selection criteria:

Item No	Description	Weighting
1	Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement a. Environmental Considerations 5% b. Buy Local 10% c. Reconciliation Action Plan 2.5% Disability Access and Inclusion 2.5%	20%
2	*Work Health & Safety (WHS)	20%
3	*Proposed Methodology, Resources and Capacity to undertake survey services	30%
4	*Demonstrated experience of tenderer and personnel performing the services	30%

All tenderers must achieve a minimum acceptable score (as determined by the City) for each of the qualitative criteria detailed above (*) in order to be considered for further evaluation.

Pricing is not included in the qualitative criteria and is considered as part of the overall value for money assessment.

Evaluation Criteria 1 – Sustainable Procurement (20%)

Evidence of Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement was assessed based on the Tenderer's responses provided to the Questionnaires within Schedules 3A, 3B, 3C and 3D which formed part of the tender documentation.

Sub Criteria a) Environmental Considerations (5%)

The City is committed to procuring goods and services that provide positive environmental, social and economic impacts over the entire life cycle of a product or service. Respondents are encouraged to provide credentials of any environmental claims of the goods and/or services submitted in this tender.

Tenderers provided details of their environmental considerations within Schedule 3A, resulting in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Fugro	1
MNG Surveys	2
Marine & Earth Sciences	3
BCE Surveying	4

Sub Criteria b) Buy Local (10%)

An assessment was made based on the response provided, detailing the following

information:

- Location of tenderer’s offices and workshops;
- Residential addresses of staff and company addresses of subcontractors;
- Purchasing arrangements through local businesses; and
- Requirement for new employees arising from award of the contract.

Tenderers provided details of their “Buy Local” considerations within Schedule 3B, resulting in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Fugro	1
Marine & Earth Sciences	1
MNG Surveys	3
BCE Surveying	3

Sub Criteria c) Reconciliation Action Plan (RAP) (2.5%)

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to:

- RELATIONSHIPS - building positive relationships between indigenous and non-indigenous people;
- RESPECT – recognising the contribution of Indigenous people to Australia and learning more about the history, culture and diversity in a two-way communication process; and
- OPPORTUNITIES – attracting, developing and retaining organisational talent to build opportunities for aboriginal employment, training, and development and mentoring.

Tenderers provided information specifying differing levels of actions in relation to indigenous reconciliation action with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Fugro	1
BCE Surveying	2
MNG Surveys	3
Marine & Earth Sciences	4

Sub Criteria d) Access & Inclusion Plan (AIP) (2.5%)

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to:

- People with disabilities having the same buildings and facilities access opportunities as other people;
- People with disabilities receiving information in a format that will enable them to access information as readily as other people are able to access it;
- People with disabilities receiving the same level and quality of service from staff as other people receive;
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to make complaints; and
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to participate in any employment opportunities.

Tenderers provided information specifying considerations for access and inclusion provisions with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
MNG Surveys	1
Fugro	2
BCE Surveying	3
Marine & Earth Sciences	4

Overall Sustainable Procurement Ranking Summary

The overall assessment of the Sustainable Procurement criteria has resulted in the following overall ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Fugro	1
MNG Surveys	2
BCE Surveying	3
Marine & Earth Sciences	4

Evaluation Criteria 2 – Tenderer’s Work Health & Safety Management Systems (20%)

Evidence of WHS management policies and practices was assessed from the tender submissions. The assessment for safety management was based on the tenderer’s responses to a specific Questionnaire included within the tender documentation.

Tenderers provided details of their safety management systems with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
MNG Surveys	1
Marine & Earth Sciences	2
BCE Surveying	3
Fugro	4

Evaluation Criteria 3 - Tenderer’s Methodology, Resources and Capacity to Undertake Survey Services (30%)

The tenderer’s proposed methodology as presented in their tender submission was assessed to evaluate their understanding of the works required and their ability to undertake the works. The tenderer’s resources were assessed to evaluate their capacity to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tenderer’s staff resources, accuracies and understanding of the proposed methodology. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
MNG Surveys	1
Fugro	2
Marine & Earth Sciences	3
BCE Surveying*	4

*BCE Surveying failed to meet the City’s minimum requirements for this evaluation criterion.

Evaluation Criteria 4 - Tenderer’s relevant experience with achievement of meeting client expectations (30%)

The tenderer’s relevant experience in demonstrating the achievement of meeting client expectations as presented in their tender submission were assessed to evaluate their capability to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tendering entity’s previous experience of similar works and the experience of the tenderer’s personnel. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
MNG Surveys	1
Fugro	2
Marine & Earth Sciences*	3
BCE Surveying*	3

*Marine & Earth Sciences and BCE Surveying failed to meet the City’s minimum requirements for this evaluation criterion.

Overall Qualitative Weighted Assessment and Ranking

Tenderer’s submissions were reviewed in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan. The overall assessment of qualitative weighted criteria resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
MNG Surveys	1
Fugro	2
Marine & Earth Sciences*	3
BCE Surveying*	4

Marine & Earth Sciences and BCE Surveying did not meet the City’s minimum requirements for at least one of the mandatory qualitative criteria and did not proceed to the value for money assessment stage.

Pricing for the Goods/Services/Works Offered

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the lump sum pricing provided with the tender documentation.

Based on the information provided, tenderers are ranked as follows:

Tenderer	Ranking
MNG Surveys	1
Fugro	2

Value for Money Assessment

The combined assessment of lump sum price and qualitative criteria resulted in the following tenderer ranking (highest to lowest):

Tenderer	Ranking
MNG Surveys	1
Fugro	2

Overall Assessment and Comment

The tender submission from MNG Surveys satisfied the overall value for money assessment in accordance with the assessment criteria and weightings as detailed in the Procurement and Evaluation Plan and is therefore recommended as the successful tenderer.

Consultation

Consultation was undertaken with all relevant internal and external stakeholders as part of this procurement process. Extensive consultation was undertaken with members of the Northern Beaches Alliance throughout this process to ensure that they are satisfied with the scope of the services provided.

The deliverables from this contract will be used in various community consultation settings to communicate seasonal, annual and long-term variations along the City’s coastline.

Statutory Compliance

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.57 of the *Local Government Act 1995*. The tendering procedures and evaluation complied with the requirements of Part 4 of the *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996*.

Strategic Implications

The proposal aligns with the following objective with the Strategic Community Plan 2021-2031:

- Goal 4 – A Sustainable City that Balances the Relationship between Urban Growth and the Environment.
Priority 4.1 Plan for climate change

Risk Appetite Statement

In pursuit of strategic objective goal 4, we will accept a Medium level of risk. The nature of the City being ‘pro-growth’ means that commercial opportunities will be explored in areas identified for development, potentially challenging perceptions of the City as an environmental steward.

Enterprise Risk Management Considerations

Risk Title	Risk Rating
ST-S06 Climate Change	Medium
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Planning and Sustainability	Manage
Risk Title	Risk Rating
ST-S04 Integrated Infrastructure and Utility Planning	Low
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Planning and Sustainability & Director Assets	Manage

Financial and Performance Risk

Financial Risk

A financial risk assessment was undertaken as part of the tender evaluation process and the outcome of this independent assessment advised that MNG Surveys has been assessed with a 'strong' financial capacity to meet the requirements of the contract.

Performance Risk

MNG Surveys have demonstrated the capacity and experience to deliver this contract effectively, based on their previous contract with the City of Wanneroo for the Provision of Coastal Surveys which extended over five years.

Policy Implications

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of the City's Purchasing Policy.

Financial (Budget) Implications

The costs associated with the Provision of Coastal Surveys for the City of Wanneroo are included in the Asset Maintenance Operational Budget and costs associated with surveys within other LGAs in the NBA will be paid in accordance with the Deed of Agreement.

Recommendation:

That the Acting Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.13 - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register for the awarding of tenders ACCEPTS the tender submitted by McMullen Nolen Group Pty Ltd (MNG Surveys) for Tender 23148, for the Provision of Coastal Surveys Across the Northern Beaches for a Maximum Total Sum of \$585,400 (assuming that all Local Governments participate in the collection of coastal surveys) for a period three (3) years with two (2) twelve month, or part thereof, options to extend at the discretion of the City.