

## **TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT**

**TO: CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER**

**CC: A/MANAGER PARKS AND CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT**

**FROM: DIRECTOR ASSETS**

**FILE REF: 23/393771**

**DATE: 05 December 2023**

---

### **TENDER 23149: PROVISION OF STREETSCAPES MAINTENANCE NORTH**

---

#### **Issue**

To consider Tender No: 23149 for the Provision of Streetscapes Maintenance North for an initial period of two (2) years with two (2), twelve (12) month, or part thereof, options to extend at the discretion of the City.

#### **Background**

Streetscapes North Maintenance Services in the City are currently undertaken by Skyline Landscape Services under Contract No. 20074. The current contract term will expire on 1 January 2024.

#### **Detail**

Tender 23149 for the Provision of Streetscapes Maintenance North was advertised on 7 October 2023 and closed on 24 October 2023. Three (3) addenda were issued to address bidder queries.

A Mandatory Site Meeting was held at the Civic Centre on 11 October 2023 with 5 companies attending.

Essential details of the proposed contract are as follows:

<b>Item</b>	<b>Detail</b>
Contract Form	Goods and / or Services
Contract Type	Lump Sum plus Schedule of Rates
Contract Duration	2 years
Commencement Date	2 January 2024
Expiry Date	1 January 2026
Extension Permitted	Yes, 2 x 12 months, or part thereof

Tender submissions were received from the following companies:

Legal Name	Trading Name
Environmental Industries Pty Ltd	Environmental Industries
Sanpoint Pty Ltd	LD Total
Skyline Landscape Services (WA) Pty Ltd	Skyline Landscape Services
Landscape Elements Pty Ltd	Landscape Elements

### Probity Oversight

Oversight to the tender assessment process was undertaken by William Buck Consulting (WA) Pty Ltd and the City's Contract Officer.

Tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan (**PEP**) which included the following selection criteria:

Item No	Description	Weighting
1	<b>Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement</b> a. Environmental Considerations 5% b. Buy Local 10% c. Reconciliation Action Plan 2.5% d. Disability Access and Inclusion 2.5%	20%
2	<b>*Work Health &amp; Safety (WHS)</b>	20%
3	<b>*Demonstrated experience relevant to this request for tender</b>	20%
4	<b>*Methodology for Streetscape maintenance Services</b> – demonstrated understanding of the methodology to deliver the services	20%
5	<b>*Demonstrated Capacity and Resources</b> – to undertake all works as specified in the Scope and Specification	20%

All tenderers must achieve a minimum acceptable score (as determined by the City) for each of the qualitative criteria detailed above (\*) in order to be considered for further evaluation.

Pricing is not included in the qualitative criteria and is considered as part of the overall value for money assessment.

All Tenderers attended the mandatory site meeting which outlined the objectives of the tender, scope of services, and addition of new sites included in the contract. All attendees were provided with a copy of the power point presentation from the session.

All submissions were deemed conforming and proceeded for further evaluation.

### **Evaluation Criteria 1 – Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement (20%)**

Evidence of Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement was assessed based on the Tenderer's responses provided to the Questionnaires within Schedules 3A, 3B, 3C and 3D which formed part of the tender documentation.

**Sub Criteria a) Environmental Considerations (5%)**

The City is committed to procuring goods and services that provide positive environmental, social and economic impacts over the entire life cycle of a product or service. Respondents are encouraged to provide credentials of any environmental claims of the goods and/or services submitted in this tender.

Tenderers provided details of their environmental considerations within Schedule 3A, with the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Environmental Industries	1
Landscape Elements	1
LD Total	3
Skyline Landscape Services	4

**Sub Criteria b) Buy Local (10%)**

An assessment was made based on the response provided, detailing the following information:

- Location of tenderer's offices and workshops;
- Residential addresses of staff and company addresses of subcontractors;
- Purchasing arrangements through local businesses;
- Requirement for new employees arising from award of the contract.

Tenderers provided details of their "Buy Local" considerations within Schedule 3B, with the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Environmental Industries	1
LD Total	1
Landscape Elements	3
Skyline Landscape Services	3

**Sub Criteria c) Reconciliation Action Plan (RAP) (2.5%)**

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to:

- RELATIONSHIPS - building positive relationships between indigenous and non-indigenous people;
- RESPECT – recognising the contribution of Indigenous people to Australia and learning more about the history, culture and diversity in a two-way communication process;
- OPPORTUNITIES – attracting, developing and retaining organisational talent to build opportunities for aboriginal employment, training, and development and mentoring.

Tenderers provided information specifying differing levels of actions in relation to indigenous reconciliation action with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Landscape Elements	1
Skyline Landscape Services	2
Environmental Industries	3
LD Total	4

**Sub Criteria d) Access & Inclusion Plan (AIP) (2.5%)**

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to:

- People with disabilities having the same buildings and facilities access opportunities as other people;
- People with disabilities receiving information in a format that will enable them to access information as readily as other people are able to access it;
- People with disabilities receiving the same level and quality of service from staff as other people receive;
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to make complaints;
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to participate in any employment opportunities.

Tenderers provided information specifying considerations for access and inclusion provisions with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Skyline Landscape Services	1
Environmental Industries	2
Landscape Elements	3
LD Total	4

**Overall Sustainable Procurement Ranking Summary**

The overall assessment of the Sustainable Procurement criteria has resulted in the following overall ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Environmental Industries	1
LD Total	2
Landscape Elements	3
Skyline Landscape Services	4

**Evaluation Criteria 2 – Work Health and Safety (20%)**

Evidence of Work Health and Safety management policies and practices were assessed from the Tender submissions. The assessment for safety management was based on the tenderer's responses to a specific Questionnaire included within the tender documentation.

Tenderers provided details of their safety management systems with the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Landscape Elements	1
Environmental Industries	2
LD Total	2
Skyline Landscape Services	4

**Evaluation Criteria 3 - Demonstrated experience relevant to this Request for tender (20%)**

The tenderer's relevant experience in demonstrating the achievement of meeting client expectations as presented in the tender submissions were assessed to evaluate Tenderers capability to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this

criterion considered the tendering entity's credentials to fulfill the requirements of the contract. The assessment of the criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Landscape Elements	1
Environmental Industries	2
LD Total	2
Skyline Landscape Services	4

#### **Evaluation Criteria 4 - Methodology for Streetscape Maintenance Services (20%)**

The assessment of this evaluation criterion considered the Tenderer's ability to demonstrate a clear understanding of Streetscapes Maintenance Services required within an urban environment, including why it is carried out and what is to be achieved to manage the contract and their proposed methodology for performance of the services. The Tenderer's provided details of their Methodology with the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Environmental Industries	1
Landscape Elements	1
LD Total	3
Skyline Landscape Services	4

#### **Evaluation Criteria 5 – Demonstrated Capacity and Resources (20%)**

The Tenderer's resources as presented in their Tender submission were assessed to evaluate their capacity to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the Tenderer's staff resources, vehicles, plant/equipment and workshop support to manage the contract. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Environmental Industries	1
Landscape Elements	2
LD Total	3
Skyline Landscape Services	3

#### **Overall Qualitative Weighted Assessment and Ranking**

Tenderer's submissions were reviewed in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan. The overall assessment of qualitative weighted criteria resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Environmental Industries	1
Landscape Elements	2
LD Total	3
Skyline Landscape Services	4

#### **Pricing for the Services Offered**

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the fixed lump sum pricing provided with the tender documentation.

Based on the information provided, tenderers are ranked as follows:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Landscape Elements	1
LD Total	2
Skyline Landscape Services	3
Environmental Industries	4

### **Value for Money Assessment**

The combined assessment of Price vs Qualitative Scores resulted in the following tender ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Landscape Elements	1
LD Total	2
Skyline Landscape Services	3
Environmental Industries	4

### **Overall Assessment and Comment**

The Evaluation Panel determined that the Tender submission from Landscape Elements satisfied the overall value for money assessment in accordance with the assessment criteria and weightings as detailed in the Procurement and Evaluation Plan and is therefore recommended as the successful Tenderer.

### **Consultation**

Not Applicable

### **Comment**

Tenders have been evaluated in accordance with the tender evaluation criteria. In accordance with the Council decision (Item CS06-12/22 refers) "Manage and Maintain Streetscapes" a service review is currently being undertaken. The service review may result in Council considering changes to the streetscapes services levels and areas managed during the term of this contract.

### **Statutory Compliance**

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.57 of the *Local Government Act 1995*. The tendering procedures and evaluation complied with the requirements of Part 4 of the *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996*.

### **Strategic Implications**

The proposal aligns with the following objective with the Strategic Community Plan 2021-2031:

*Goal 5 – A well-planned, safe and resilient City that is easy to travel around and provides a connection between people and places*

*5.3 – Responsibly managed and maintained assets*

### **Risk Appetite Statement**

In pursuit of strategic objective goal 5, we will accept a Medium level of risk, extended to high in the areas of Community/Reputation & Financial/Commercial impacts. Shifting transport modes and usage in the City may require short term pain for longer

term gain as the City supports the development, maintenance and connection of alternatives to car use (e.g. cycle ways) and the supporting infrastructure.

**Risk Management Considerations**

<b>Risk Title</b>	<b>Risk Rating</b>
ST-S23 Stakeholder Relationships	Low
<b>Accountability</b>	<b>Action Planning Option</b>
Director Corporate Strategy and Performance	Manage

<b>Risk Title</b>	<b>Risk Rating</b>
CO-022 Environmental Management	Low
<b>Accountability</b>	<b>Action Planning Option</b>
Director Corporate Strategy and Performance	Manage

**Policy Implications**

Tenderers were invited in accordance with the requirements of the City’s Purchasing Policy.

**Financial Implications**

The costs associated with Tender 23149 for the Provision of Streetscapes Maintenance North are included in the Parks & Conservation Annual Operating Budget.

The scheduled maintenance is delivered as per the scope and specification of the contract with a lump sum and a schedule of rates for additional works as and when required.

Financial Risk

A financial risk assessment was undertaken by Equifax Australasia Credit Ratings Pty Ltd as part of the tender evaluation process and the outcome of this independent assessment advised that Landscape Elements is assessed with the financial capacity to meet the requirements of the contract.

Performance Risk

Landscape Elements holds several maintenance contracts with Local, State and other Government agencies including the City of Wanneroo with no history of disputes or claims reported in the last five years. Landscape Elements is also a registered WALGA panel member for these services.

23149: Provision of Streetscape Maintenance North

**Recommendation:**

**That the Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.13 - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register for the awarding of tenders ACCEPTS the tender submitted by Landscape Elements for Tender 23149, for the Provision of Streetscapes Maintenance North, as per fixed lump sum of \$671,762.99 and as per schedule of rates in the tender submission, with the option of two (2), twelve (12) month, or part thereof, options to extend subject to performance and funding availability in each of the financial years within the two year contract term.**