

TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT

TO: CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

**CC: MANAGER PARKS AND CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT
MANAGER ASSETS MAINTENANCE**

FROM: DIRECTOR ASSETS

FILE REF: 24/40647

DATE: 16 FEBRUARY 2024

TENDER 23183 SUPPLY OF FERTILISER – WETTING AGENTS – TURF PRODUCTS AND SEED

Issue

To consider Tender No: 23183 for the Supply of Fertiliser, Wetting Agents, Turf Products and Seed for an initial period of six (6) months, with one (1), six (6) month option to extend.

Background

Fertiliser, Wetting Agents, Turf Products and Seed were previously supplied to the City under Contract 21144. This Contract commenced in January 2022 and expired in January 2024.

Due to the continuous need for the supply of fertilisers, wetting agents, pesticides and turf seed for use by City staff and application by City contractors and the wide variety of products utilised, a supply contract is seen as the most time efficient and cost effective method of procuring these goods.

The tender document as advertised provided for a large variety of products to be utilised so that City staff may ensure they have access to the correct product for each application based on specific site conditions across the City.

Detail

Tender 23183 for the Supply of Fertiliser, Wetting Agents, Turf Products and Seed was advertised on 2 December 2023 and closed on 19 December 2023. Two (2) Addenda were issued which provided clarification to the pricing schedule along with answers to queries raised in relation to products.

The tender was advertised as separable portions due to the wide range of products, differing manufacturers and different supplier access to these manufacturers' products. The tender was structured in this way to enable separable portions to be awarded to a number of suppliers as required and provide the City with the best value for money option for each product.

Essential details of the proposed contract are as follows:

Item	Detail
Contract Form	Goods and Services
Contract Type	Schedule of Rates
Contract Duration	6 Months
Commencement Date	February 2024
Expiry Date	August 2024
Extension Permitted	Yes, one (1) period of six (6) months or part thereof

Tender submissions were received from the following companies:

Legal Name	Trading Name	Abbreviation
Australian Agribusiness (Holdings) Pty Ltd	Nuturf	Nuturf
A.K.C. Pty Ltd	Baileys Fertilisers	Baileys
Greenshed Pty Ltd	Living Turf	Living Turf
Greenway Turf Solutions Pty Ltd	Greenway Turf Solutions	Greenway
Green Workz Pty Ltd	Green Workz	Green Workz

Probity Oversight

Oversight to the tender assessment process was undertaken by an external Probity Advisor (William Buck Consulting (WA) Pty Ltd) and the City's Acting Contracts Officer.

Please refer to the Confidential Attachment for reference to the external Probity Advisor Final Report.

Tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan (**PEP**) which included the following selection criteria:

Item No	Description	Weighting
1	Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement a. Environmental Considerations 5% b. Buy Local 10% c. Reconciliation Action Plan 5% d. Disability Access & Inclusion 5%	25%
2	*Work Health & Safety (WHS)	10%
3	*Capacity to supply products within specified timeframes	35%
4	*Demonstrated experience supplying fertilisers, wetting agents, pesticides and turf seed within Western Australia	30%

All tenderers must meet the City's minimum requirements (as determined by the City) for each of the qualitative criteria detailed above (*) in order to be considered for further evaluation.

Pricing is not included in the qualitative criteria and is considered as part of the overall value for money assessment.

All tender submissions were deemed conforming and proceeded for further evaluation.

Evaluation Criteria 1 – Sustainable Procurement (25%)

Evidence of Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement was assessed based on the tenderer’s responses provided to the Questionnaires within Schedules 3A, 3B, 3C and 3D which formed part of the tender documentation.

Sub Criteria a) Environmental Considerations (5%)

The City is committed to procuring goods and services that provide positive environmental, social and economic impacts over the entire life cycle of a product or service. Respondents are encouraged to provide credentials of any environmental claims of the goods and/or services submitted in this tender.

All tenderers provided details of their environmental considerations within Schedule 3A, with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Baileys	1
Nuturf	2
Green Workz	3
Greenway	3
Living Turf	3

Sub Criteria b) Buy Local (10%)

An assessment was made based on the response provided, detailing the following information:

- Location of tenderer’s offices and workshops;
- Residential addresses of staff and company addresses of subcontractors;
- Purchasing arrangements through local businesses;
- Requirement for new employees arising from award of the contract.

All tenderers provided details of their “Buy Local” considerations within Schedule 3A, with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Nuturf	1
Baileys	1
Green Workz	1
Greenway	4
Living Turf	5

Sub Criteria c) Reconciliation Action Plan (RAP) (5%)

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to:

- RELATIONSHIPS - building positive relationships between indigenous and non-indigenous people;
- RESPECT – recognising the contribution of Indigenous people to Australia and learning more about the history, culture and diversity in a two-way communication process;
- OPPORTUNITIES – attracting, developing and retaining organisational talent to build opportunities for aboriginal employment, training, and

development and mentoring.

All tenderers provided information specifying differing levels of actions in relation to indigenous reconciliation action with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Greenway	1
Nuturf	2
Green Workz	2
Baileys	4
Living Turf	5

Sub Criteria d) Access & Inclusion Plan (AIP) (5%)

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to:

- People with disabilities having the same buildings and facilities access opportunities as other people;
- People with disabilities receiving information in a format that will enable them to access information as readily as other people are able to access it;
- People with disabilities receiving the same level and quality of service from staff as other people receive;
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to make complaints;
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to participate in any employment opportunities.

All tenderers provided information specifying differing levels of consideration for access and inclusion provisions with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Nuturf	1
Greenway	1
Green Workz	3
Baileys	4
Living Turf	5

Overall Sustainable Procurement Ranking Summary

The following presents the overall Sustainable Procurement criterion ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Nuturf	1
Baileys	2
Green Workz	3
Greenway	4
Living Turf	5

Evaluation Criteria 2 - Tenderer's Safety Management Systems (10 %)

Evidence of WHS management policies and practices was assessed from the tender submissions. The assessment for safety management was based on the tenderer's responses to a specific questionnaire included within the tender documentation.

The tenderers were ranked as shown below under this criterion:

Tenderer	Ranking
Greenway	1
Nuturf	2
Baileys	3
Green Workz	4
Living Turf	5

Evaluation Criteria 3 - Capacity to Supply Products within Specified Timeframes (35 %)

The tenderer's resources as presented in their tender submission were assessed to evaluate their capacity to meet the requirements of the Contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tenderer's staff methodology, resources, vehicles, plant/equipment and workshop support to manage the contract.

The tenderers were ranked as shown below under this assessment criterion:

Tenderer	Ranking
Baileys	1
Nuturf	2
Living Turf	2
Greenway	4
Green Workz	5

Evaluation Criteria 4 - Demonstrated Experience Supplying Fertilisers, Wetting Agents, Pesticides and Turf Seed (30 %)

The tenderer's relevant experience in demonstrating the achievement of meeting client expectations as presented in their tender submission were assessed in order to evaluate their capability to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tendering entity's credentials to fulfil the requirements of the contract.

The tenderers were ranked as shown below under this assessment criterion:

Tenderer	Ranking
Baileys	1
Nuturf	2
Living Turf	3
Greenway	4
Green Workz	5

Overall Qualitative Weighted Assessment

Tenderer	Ranking
Baileys	1
Nuturf	2
Living Turf	3
Greenway	4
Green Workz	5

Pricing for the Goods

Due to the large number of separable portions, price comparisons were undertaken on each individual separable portion. Further details of individual pricing is available in the Confidential Memo.

Value for Money Assessment

The combined assessment of Price vs Qualitative Scores on an overall value for money basis resulted in the following outcomes for each Separable Portion and individual price schedule.

A number of the separable portions were not recommended for award due to no tenderer providing pricing for these items. The items that have not been awarded through this tender process will be purchased on a as required basis from product stockists in accordance with the City's Purchasing Policy.

Price Schedule 1A - Pesticides	Recommended Tenderer
Separable Portion 1	Nuturf
Separable Portion 2	Nuturf
Separable Portion 3	Nuturf
Separable Portion 4	Greenway
Separable Portion 5	Living Turf
Separable Portion 6	Nuturf
Separable Portion 7	Nuturf
Separable Portion 8	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 9	Nuturf
Separable Portion 10	Living Turf
Separable Portion 11	Greenway
Separable Portion 12	Greenway
Separable Portion 13	Nuturf
Separable Portion 14	Living Turf

Price Schedule 1B - Fertiliser	Recommended Tenderer
Separable Portion 1	Living Turf
Separable Portion 2	Nuturf
Separable Portion 3	Baileys
Separable Portion 4	Nuturf
Separable Portion 5	Living Turf
Separable Portion 6	Nuturf
Separable Portion 7	Living Turf
Separable Portion 8	Nuturf
Separable Portion 9	Nuturf
Separable Portion 10	Living Turf
Separable Portion 11	Greenway
Separable Portion 12	Green Workz

Price Schedule 1C - Seed	Recommended Tenderer
Separable Portion 1	Nuturf
Separable Portion 2	Nuturf
Separable Portion 3	Nuturf
Separable Portion 4	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 5	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 6	Greenway

Price Schedule 1D - Wetting Agents	Recommended Tenderer
Separable Portion 1	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 2	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 3	Green Workz
Separable Portion 4	Nuturf
Separable Portion 5	Living Turf
Separable Portion 6	Nuturf
Separable Portion 7	Living Turf
Separable Portion 8	Living Turf

Price Schedule 1E - Miscellaneous	Recommended Tenderer
Separable Portion 1	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 2	Nuturf
Separable Portion 3	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 4	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 5	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 6	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 7	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 8	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 9	Greenway
Separable Portion 10	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 11	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 12	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 13	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 14	Not recommended for award

Price Schedule 1E - Miscellaneous	Recommended Tenderer
Separable Portion 15	Greenway
Separable Portion 16	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 17	Living Turf
Separable Portion 18	Nuturf
Separable Portion 19	Greenway
Separable Portion 20	Not recommended for award
Separable Portion 21	Nuturf

Overall Assessment and Comment

The tender submissions from Bailey's, Nuturf, Greenway, Green Workz and Living Turf satisfied requirements in accordance with the assessment criteria and weightings as detailed in the PEP.

Consultation

Nil.

Statutory Compliance

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.57 of the *Local Government Act 1995*. The tendering procedures and evaluation complied with the requirements of Part 4 of the *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996*.

Strategic Implications

The proposal aligns with the following objective with the Strategic Community Plan 2021-2031:

“Goal 4 A sustainable city that of importance to the future of the City. balances the relationship between urban grow the and the environment”

Priority 4.3: Manage natural assets and resources.

Risk Appetite Statement

In pursuit of strategic objective goal 4, we will accept a Medium level of risk. The nature of the City being 'pro-growth' means that commercial opportunities will be explored in areas identified for development, potentially challenging perceptions of the City as an environmental steward.

Enterprise Risk Management Considerations

Risk Title	Risk Rating	Accountability	Action Planning Option
CO-O01 Relationship Management	Moderate	Director Corporate Strategy and Performance	Manage

Risk Title	Risk Rating	Accountability	Action Planning Option
CO-O08 Contract Management	Moderate	Director Corporate Strategy and Performance	Manage

Risk Title	Risk Rating	Accountability	Action Planning Option
------------	-------------	----------------	------------------------

23183 – Supply of Fertilisers, Wetting Agents, Turf Products and Seed

CO-O17 Financial Management	Moderate	Director Corporate Strategy and Performance	Manage
CO-O22 Environmental Management	Moderate	Director Planning and Sustainability	Manage

Financial Risk

Due to the expected value of individual contracts and the relatively low risk due to goods not being receipted until fully received and verified, no independent financial risk assessment of recommended suppliers is deemed necessary.

Performance Risk

All tenderer's have supplied products to the City in the past 12 months in line with the requirements of the expiring contract.

Policy Implications

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of the City's Purchasing Policy.

Financial (Budget) Implications

The costs associated with 23183 – Supply of Fertiliser, Wetting Agent, Turf Products and Seed are included in the annual Parks and Conservation Management Operational Budget.

Recommendation:

That the Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.13 - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register for the awarding of Tenders ACCEPTS the Tenders submitted as per schedule of rates (subject to appropriate funding availability, for each of the financial years within the initial contract term) as follows:

AKC Pty Ltd trading as Baileys Fertilisers
Price Schedule B - Separable Portion 3

Australian Agribusiness (Holdings) Pty Ltd trading as Nuturf
Price Schedule A - Separable Portion 1
Price Schedule A - Separable Portion 2
Price Schedule A - Separable Portion 3
Price Schedule A - Separable Portion 6
Price Schedule A - Separable Portion 7
Price Schedule A - Separable Portion 9
Price Schedule A - Separable Portion 13
Price Schedule A - Separable Portion 14
Price Schedule B - Separable Portion 2
Price Schedule B - Separable Portion 4
Price Schedule B - Separable Portion 6
Price Schedule B - Separable Portion 8
Price Schedule B - Separable Portion 9
Price Schedule C - Separable Portion 1
Price Schedule C - Separable Portion 2
Price Schedule C - Separable Portion 3
Price Schedule D - Separable Portion 4
Price Schedule D - Separable Portion 6
Price Schedule E - Separable Portion 2
Price Schedule E - Separable Portion 18
Price Schedule E - Separable Portion 21

GREENSHED Pty Ltd trading as Living Turf
Price Schedule A - Separable Portion 5
Price Schedule A - Separable Portion 10
Price Schedule B - Separable Portion 1
Price Schedule B - Separable Portion 5
Price Schedule B - Separable Portion 7
Price Schedule B - Separable Portion 10
Price Schedule D - Separable Portion 5
Price Schedule D - Separable Portion 7
Price Schedule D - Separable Portion 8
Price Schedule E - Separable Portion 17

Greenway Turf Solutions Pty Ltd trading as Greenway Turf Solutions
Price Schedule A - Separable Portion 4
Price Schedule A - Separable Portion 11
Price Schedule A - Separable Portion 12
Price Schedule B - Separable Portion 11
Price Schedule C - Separable Portion 6
Price Schedule E - Separable Portion 15
Price Schedule E - Separable Portion 19

Green Workz Pty Ltd trading as Green Workz
Price Schedule B - Separable Portion 12
Price Schedule D - Separable Portion 3
Price Schedule E - Separable Portion 9

And in accordance with Delegation 1.1.13 (2) - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register DECLINES to accept any other Tenders for the remaining Schedules.