

TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT

TO: CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

CC: ACTING MANAGER PARKS AND CONSERVATION
MANAGEMENT

FROM: ACTING DIRECTOR ASSETS

FILE REF: 24/98220

DATE: 10 APRIL 2024

**TENDER 24020: LAKE JOONDALUP PARK AND ALEXANDER PARK
IRRIGATION REPLACEMENT AND LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS**

Issue

To consider Tender No: 24020 for the Lake Joondalup Park and Alexander Park Irrigation Replacement and Landscape Improvements.

Background

The irrigation systems at Lake Joondalup and Alexander Parks have reached the end of their serviceable life and require replacement. This is part of ongoing City initiatives to improve irrigation efficiencies and reduce groundwater use within public open space.

Detail

Tender 24020 for Separable Portion 1 – Alexander Heights Park Irrigation Replacement and Landscape Improvements and Separable Portion 2 – Lake Joondalup Park Irrigation Replacement and Landscape Improvements was advertised on Saturday 17 February 2024 and closed on Wednesday 6 March 2024. There were three (3) addenda issued.

Essential details of the proposed contract are as follows:

Item	Detail
Contract Form	Separable Portion
Contract Type	Schedule of Rates
Contract Duration	10 Weeks
Commencement Date	April 2024
Expiry Date	June 2024

TENDER 24020: LAKE JOONDALUP PARK AND ALEXANDER PARK IRRIGATION REPLACEMENT AND LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS

Tender submissions were received from the following companies:

Legal Name	Trading Name	Abbreviation
Horizon West Landscape and Irrigation Pty Ltd	Horizon West Landscape and Irrigation	Horizon West
Sanpoint Pty Ltd ATF Fiore Family Trust	LD Total	LD Total
Double G (WA) Pty Ltd	Thinkwater Perth	Thinkwater

Probity Oversight

Oversight to the tender assessment process was undertaken by an external Probity Advisor (William Buck Consulting (WA) Pty Ltd) and the City’s Acting Contracts Officer.

Please refer to the Confidential Attachment for reference to the value for money (VFM) considerations and to the external Probity Advisor Final Report.

Tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan (PEP) which included the following selection criteria:

Item No	Description	Weighting
1	Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement a) Environmental Considerations 5% b) Buy Local 10% c) Reconciliation Action Plan 5% d) Access and Inclusion 5%	25%
2	*Work Health & Safety (WHS)	20%
3	*Demonstrated experience installing commercial irrigation	25%
4	*Demonstrated available resources to complete the project in the specified timeframe	30%

All tenderers must meet the City’s minimum requirements (as determined by the City) for each of the qualitative criteria detailed above (*) in order to be considered for further evaluation.

Pricing is not included in the qualitative criteria and is considered as part of the overall VFM assessment.

All three tenderers’ submissions received, Horizon West, LD Total and Thinkwater, are conforming tenders.

Evaluation Criteria 1 – Sustainable Procurement (25%)

Evidence of Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement was assessed based on the tenderer’s responses provided to the Questionnaires within Schedules 3A, 3B, 3C and 3D which formed part of the tender documentation.

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the following sub-criteria:

TENDER 24020: LAKE JOONDALUP PARK AND ALEXANDER PARK IRRIGATION REPLACEMENT AND LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS

Sub Criteria a) Environmental Considerations (5%)

The City is committed to procuring goods and services that provide positive environmental, social and economic impacts over the entire life cycle of a product or service. Respondents are encouraged to provide credentials of any environmental claims of the goods and/or services submitted in this tender.

The submissions received from Horizon West, LD Total and Thinkwater provided detail relating to the environmental considerations within Schedule 3A

Environmental considerations within Schedule 3A ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Horizon West	1
LD Total	1
Thinkwater	3

Sub Criteria b) Buy Local (10%)

The City encourages the development of competitive local businesses within its boundaries. This commitment includes but is not limited to purchasing locally, providing an advantage to businesses based in the local area and businesses that can demonstrate economic benefits to the City community e.g. Local employment.

An assessment was made based on the response to the Schedule 3B questionnaire detailing the following information:

- Location of tenderer’s offices and workshops.
- Residential addresses of staff and company addresses of subcontractors.
- Purchasing arrangements through local businesses.
- Requirement for new employees arising from award of the contract.

Horizon West, LD Total and Thinkwater provided details of their “Buy Local” considerations within Schedule 3B, with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Horizon West	1
Thinkwater	2
LD Total	3

Sub Criteria c) Reconciliation Action Plan (RAP) (5%)

The City values its vision of creating an inclusive community with strong relationships across cultures based on mutual respect and understanding.

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses to the Schedule 3C questionnaire that relate to:

- RELATIONSHIPS - building positive relationships between indigenous and non-indigenous people.
- RESPECT – recognising the contribution of Indigenous people to Australia and learning more about the history, culture, and diversity in a two-way communication process.

TENDER 24020: LAKE JOONDALUP PARK AND ALEXANDER PARK IRRIGATION REPLACEMENT AND LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS

- OPPORTUNITIES – attracting, developing, and retaining organisational talent to build opportunities for aboriginal employment, training, and development and mentoring.

Horizon West, LD Total and Thinkwater provided information specifying differing levels of actions relating to indigenous reconciliation. Assessment of information supplied resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
LD Total	1
Horizon West	2
Thinkwater	3

Sub Criteria d) Access & Inclusion Plan (AIP) (5%)

As demonstrated within the City's AIP and Strategic Community Plan, agents and contractors are required to read and to the extent practicable implement the relevant strategies.

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to schedule 3D and:

- People with disabilities having the same buildings and facilities access opportunities as other **people**.
- People with disabilities receiving information in a format that will enable them to access information as readily as other people are able to access it;
- People with disabilities receiving the same level and quality of service from staff as other people **receive**.
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to make **complaints**.
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to participate in any employment opportunities.

Horizon West, LD Total and Thinkwater provided information specifying considerations for access and inclusion provisions with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Horizon West	1
LD Total	2
Thinkwater	3

Overall Sustainable Procurement Ranking Summary

Horizon West, LD Total and Thinkwater have demonstrated a general commitment to the City Sustainable Procurement objectives as evidenced by the company initiatives. Reduction of CO2 emissions through changes to lighting in offices, recycling of numerous products and waterwise initiatives.

All have a percentage of locally based workforce from within the City boundaries. All respondents recognise the RAP and AIP compliant practices and are working towards implementation.

TENDER 24020: LAKE JOONDALUP PARK AND ALEXANDER PARK IRRIGATION REPLACEMENT AND LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS

The overall assessment of the Sustainable Procurement criteria has resulted in the following overall ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Horizon West	1
LD Total	2
Thinkwater	3

Evaluation Criteria 2 – Tenderer’s Safety Management Systems (20%)

Evidence of WHS management policies and practices was assessed from the tender submissions. The assessment for safety management was based on the tenderer’s responses to a specific questionnaire included within the tender documentation.

Tenderers provided details of their safety management systems with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Horizon West	1
Thinkwater	2
LD Total	3

Evaluation Criteria 3 – Demonstrated experience installing commercial irrigation (25%)

The tenderer’s resources as presented in their tender submission were assessed in order to evaluate their capacity to meet the requirements of the contract.

Assessment of this criterion considered the tenderer’s staff resources, vehicles, plant/equipment and workshop support to manage the contract. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Horizon West, LD Total and Thinkwater all provided evidence of recent experience in similar commercial irrigation installations.

Tenderer	Ranking
Thinkwater	1
Horizon West	1
LD Total	3

Evaluation Criteria 4 – Demonstrated available resources to complete the project in the specified timeframe (30%)

The tenderer’s relevant experience in demonstrating the achievement of meeting client expectations as presented in their tender submission were assessed to evaluate their capability to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the respondent’s staff resources, vehicles, plant/equipment, and workshop support to manage the contract.

Whilst all tenderers were assessed as having demonstrated available resources to complete either Separable Portion 1 or 2, none of the tenderers provided sufficient evidence to support the capability to be awarded both Separable Portion 1 and Separable Portion 2 and complete them within the given timeframe, particularly noting the two installations will have an overlap period.

TENDER 24020: LAKE JOONDALUP PARK AND ALEXANDER PARK IRRIGATION REPLACEMENT AND LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS

The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Thinkwater	1
Horizon West	2
Sanpoint Pty Ltd (LD Total)	2

Overall Qualitative Weighted Assessment and Ranking

Tenderer's submissions were reviewed in accordance with the PEP. The overall assessment of qualitative weighted criteria resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Horizon West	1
Thinkwater	2
Sanpoint Pty Ltd (LD Total)	3

Pricing for the Goods/Services/Works Offered

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the lump sum pricing provided for each separable portion with the tender documentation.

Based on the information provided, tenderers are ranked as follows:

Separable Portion 1

Tenderer	Ranking
Horizon West	1
Thinkwater	2
Sanpoint Pty Ltd (LD Total)	3

Separable Portion 2

Tenderer	Ranking
Horizon West	1
Thinkwater	2
Sanpoint Pty Ltd (LD Total)	3

Value for Money (VFM) Assessment

The combined assessment of pricing and qualitative criteria resulted in the following tenderer ranking (highest to lowest):

Separable Portion 1

Tenderer	Ranking
Horizon West	1
Thinkwater	2
Sanpoint Pty Ltd (LD Total)	3

Separable Portion 2

Tenderer	Ranking
Horizon West	1
Thinkwater	2
Sanpoint Pty Ltd (LD Total)	3

TENDER 24020: LAKE JOONDALUP PARK AND ALEXANDER PARK IRRIGATION REPLACEMENT AND LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS

Overall Assessment and Comment

For operational reasons the City is recommending Horizon West as the successful tenderer for Separable Portion 1 and Thinkwater as the successful tenderer for Separable Portion 2.

The confidential attachment provides further detail for the awarding of the works to separate contractors.

Consultation

Consultation with project stakeholders and the local community will occur prior to the commencement of installation works. This will be undertaken through notification of works notices and updates to the City's website.

Statutory Compliance

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.57 of the *Local Government Act 1995*. The tendering procedures and evaluation complied with the requirements of Part 4 of the *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996*.

Strategic Implications

The proposal aligns with the following objective with the Strategic Community Plan 2021-2031:

Goal 4: A sustainable City that balances the relationship between urban growth and the environment

Priority 4.3

Risk Appetite Statement

In pursuit of strategic objective goal 4, we will accept a medium level of risk. The nature of the City being 'pro-growth' means that commercial opportunities will be explored in areas identified for development, potentially challenging perceptions of the City as an environmental steward.

Enterprise Risk Management Considerations

Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-001 Relationship Management	Moderate
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Corporate Strategy and Performance	Manage

Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-008 Contract Management	Moderate
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Corporate Strategy and Performance	Manage

TENDER 24020: LAKE JOONDALUP PARK AND ALEXANDER PARK IRRIGATION REPLACEMENT AND LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS

Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-O17 Financial Management	Moderate
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Corporate Strategy and Performance	Manage

Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-O22 Environmental Management	Moderate
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Planning and Sustainability	Manage

Financial and Performance Risk

Financial Risk

A financial risk assessment was undertaken by Equifax Australasia Credit Ratings Pty Ltd as part of the tender evaluation process and the outcome of this independent assessment advised that both Horizon West and Thinkwater are assessed with the financial capacity to meet the requirements of the contract.

Performance Risk

Horizon West has demonstrated the capacity and experience to deliver the tender works effectively based on previous contracts with the City.

Thinkwater has demonstrated the capacity and experience to deliver the tender works effectively based on recent contracts with the City.

Policy Implications

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of the City's Purchasing Policy.

TENDER 24020: LAKE JOONDALUP PARK AND ALEXANDER PARK IRRIGATION REPLACEMENT AND LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS

Financial (Budget) Implications

Capital Works:

004463 PMO17022Y24

Irrigation Infrastructure Replacement and Rehabilitation Program Project

Description	Expenditure	Budget
Budget: \$ 1,496,200		1,496,200
Expenditure:		
Expenditure incurred to date	696,602	
Commitment to date	219,010	
Project Management	65,000	
Tender Advertisements (Tender and Public Notices)		
Tender 24020 (This tender)	388,768	
-		
-		
-		
-		
-		
Total Expenditure	1,369,380	
Funds to be used for other components of PR-004463 (2023/24)		126,820

TENDER 24020: LAKE JOONDALUP PARK AND ALEXANDER PARK IRRIGATION REPLACEMENT AND LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS

Recommendation:

That the Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.13 - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register for the awarding of tenders

- 1) ACCEPTS the tender submitted by Horizon West for Separable Portion #1 of Tender 24020 for the Lake Joondalup Park and Alexander Park Irrigation Replacement and Landscape Improvements, as per the Fixed lump sum in the tender submissions and;**
- 2) ACCEPTS the tender submitted by Thinkwater (Double G) for Separable Portion 2 of Tender 24020 for the Lake Joondalup Park and Alexander Park Irrigation Replacement and Landscape Improvements, as per the Fixed lump sum in the tender submissions.**