





Community Consultation Quinns Beach Long Term Coastal Management Options

Joanna Garcia-Webb

Prepared for the City of Wanneroo, 27th April 2016

#### Community Information Session

- Cardno Presentation
- Breakout Sessions
- Formal Q/A Session
- Community Feedback









- 1. Initial studies & groyne construction 1999-2004
- 2. Coastal Management Review 2012-2014
- 3. Emergency Protection Works 2013-2014
- 4. Metocean Data Collection 2014 & 2015
- 5. Quinns Beach Long Term Coastal Management Study





## Quinns Beach Long Term Coastal Management Study

- Stage 1: Coastal Processes Assessment
- Stage 2: Coastal Management Options Assessment
  - Conceptual options assessment
    - Multi-criteria analysis
    - Community Reference Group workshops
  - Outcome: Two Preferred Options
- Stage 3: Detailed Design
- Stage 4: Tendering and Construction
- Stage 5: Advice post construction





# Coastal Processes Assessment





## Approach and Methodology







#### **Coastal Processes Conclusions**

- Quinn's Beach experiencing erosion due to unbalanced sediment budget
- Estimated sediment deficit of 20,000 m<sup>3</sup> annually due to loss of sand offshore during storms
- Presence of coastal structures localise impacts of storm erosion. Erosion location dependant on climatic conditions over previous seasons / months
- Similarly, coastal structures can be used to retain sand in specific locations → focus management & sand loss to lower amenity, higher resilience shorelines
- Ongoing, active coastal monitoring and management will be necessary at Quinns Beach





# Conceptual Options Assessment





#### **Conceptual Options Assessment**

Assess coastal management options and identify a preferred option based on a multi-criteria analysis

- Three rounds of quantitative options assessment and refinement with review and input from the City and Department of Transport
  - 20 options assessed / modelled (including community suggestions)
- Reduced to 5 options for Multi-criteria Assessment
- Workshops with Community Reference group
  - Refinement of MCA scoring
- Top 2 scored options from MCA discussed today
- Community Feedback & Council decision on preferred option





# Key Stakeholder!







2016/02/24

# **Preferred Options**





#### Preferred Coastal Management Option 1

**Option 1** – Modify existing groynes (2 & 3), add new northern groyne (groyne 4) and beach renourishment.

- Aims to protect car park and dog beach areas by trapping and holding greater volume of sand.
- Longer, extended groynes will result in significant seasonal variation in beach width and may result in increased erosion north of Quinns Beach in long term.





# Option 1 Extend Groynes 2 & 3,

Extend Groynes 2 & Add new Groyne 4, Renourishment





# Option 1 - Modification of Existing Groynes



**OPTION 1 - GROYNE 2 EXTENSION** 

QUINNS BEACH OPTIONS

11 Harvest Terrace, West Perth, WA, 6005, Australia Phone: +61 8 9273 3888 Web: www.cardno.com



N

DATE DRAWING NO ISSUE 20/04/2016 59915802-LA-SK-005 F

CITY OF WANNEROO

# Option 1 - Modification of Existing Groynes



OPTION 1 - GROYNE 2 & 3 EXTENSION, GROYNE 4 & BEACH RENOURISHMENT

N

CITY OF WANNEROO QUINNS BEACH OPTIONS DATE DRAWING NO ISSUE 20/04/2016 59915802-LA-SK-008 С



11 Harvest Terrace, West Perth, WA, 6005, Australia Phone: +61 8 9273 3888 Web: www.cardno.com



# Option 1 - Groyne 2 Extension

	Location Plan - Section D	
		existing groyne
/	proposed groyne extension	4
/		
	existing groyn	e ievei
		The Base and State and Sta

Section D



OPTION 1 - GROYNE 2 EXTENSION

 CITY OF WANNEROO
 QUINNS BEACH OPTIONS

 DATE
 DRAWNIG NO
 ISSUE

 2004/2016
 59915802-LA-SK-006
 F

## Option 1 - Groyne 3 Extension



Location Plan - Section E (T)N



11 Harvest Terrace, West Perth, WA, 6005, Australia Phone: +61 8 9273 3888 Web: www.cardno.com



OPTION 1 - GROYNE 3 EXTENSION

CITY OF WANNEROO QUINNS BEACH OPTIONS

DATE DRAWING NO ISSUE 20/04/2016 59915802-LA-SK-007 F

# Option 1 & 2 - Groyne 4



Location Plan - Section C (T)N



Section C



OPTION 1 & OPTION 2 - GROYNE 4

CITY OF WANNEROO QUINNS BEACH OPTIONS

DATE DRAWING NO ISSUE 20/04/2016 59915802-LA-SK-004 F

# Option 1 - Groyne 2 Extension



# Option 1 - Groyne 2 Extension



# Key Stakeholders

All Andrew Coloradore

T







#### Preferred Coastal Management Option 2

**Option 2** – Relocate Quinns Beach Car Park, add new northern groyne (groyne 4) and beach renourishment.

- Removal of existing car park and dune rehabilitation will enable natural beach erosion and recovery cycles to occur without damage to infrastructure.
- Establish new car park to south with greater number of car bays, set back from beach.
- Construction of groyne 4 will aid in trapping and holding sand to south of structure, reducing erosion issues.
- Retention of existing groyne (1, 2 & 3) lengths will allow sand to bypass the existing structures - less likely to have negative impacts to the north of Quinns Beach in the long term.







# Option 2 - Relocation of the Car Park

![](_page_24_Picture_1.jpeg)

OPTION 2 - RELOCATED CAR PARK

11 Harvest Terrace, West Perth, Cardno Phone: +61 8 9273 3888 Web: www.cardno.com haping the Future

![](_page_24_Picture_4.jpeg)

WA, 6005, Australia

 $\rightarrow N$ 

QUINNS BEACH OPTIONS DATE DRAWING NO **ISSUE** 20/04/2016 59915802-LA-SK-001 F

CITY OF WANNEROO

# Option 2 - Relocation of the Car Park

![](_page_25_Picture_1.jpeg)

OPTION 2 - GROYNE 4 & BEACH RENOURISHMENT

CITY OF WANNEROO QUINNS BEACH OPTIONS DATE DRAWING NO ISSUE 20/04/2016 59915802-LA-SK-009 B

11 Harvest Terrace, West Perth, WA, 6005, Australia Phone: +61 8 9273 3888 Web: www.cardno.com

![](_page_25_Picture_5.jpeg)

N

## Option 2 - North of Groyne 1

![](_page_26_Picture_1.jpeg)

Location Plan - Section A (T)N

![](_page_26_Figure_3.jpeg)

11 Hanvest Terrace, West Perft, WA, 6005, Australia Phone: +618 \$2273 3888 Web: www.cardho.com

![](_page_26_Picture_5.jpeg)

OPTION 2 - RELOCATE CAR PARK, NORTH

CITY OF WANNEROO QUINNS BEACH OPTIONS
DATE DRAWING N0 ISSUE
20/04/2016 59915802-LA-SK-002 F

## Option 2 – New Car Park

![](_page_27_Picture_1.jpeg)

Location Plan - Section B (T)N

![](_page_27_Figure_3.jpeg)

OPTION 2 - RELOCATE CAR PARK, SOUTH

11 Harvest Terrace, West Perth, WA, 6005, Australia Shaping the Future Phone: +61 8 9273 3888 Web: www.cardno.com

![](_page_27_Picture_6.jpeg)

CITY OF WANNEROO QUINNS BEACH OPTIONS

DATE DRAWING NO ISSUE 20/04/2016 59915802-LA-SK-003 F

# Option 1 & 2 - Groyne 4

![](_page_28_Picture_1.jpeg)

Location Plan - Section C (T)N

![](_page_28_Picture_3.jpeg)

Section C

![](_page_28_Picture_6.jpeg)

OPTION 1 & OPTION 2 - GROYNE 4

CITY OF WANNEROO QUINNS BEACH OPTIONS

DATE DRAWING NO ISSUE 20/04/2016 59915802-LA-SK-004 F

# Multi-Criteria Analysis

Pros & Cons of the Two Preferred Options

![](_page_29_Picture_2.jpeg)

![](_page_29_Picture_3.jpeg)

#### Multi-Criteria Assessment

- Public perception
- Environmental impacts / impact on adjacent coastline
- Likely effectiveness
- Capital cost
- Maintenance cost
- Safety
- Adaptability for climate change

![](_page_30_Picture_8.jpeg)

![](_page_30_Picture_9.jpeg)

# Pros & Cons

	Advantages	Disadvantages
Option 1	<ul> <li>Provides protection and improved storm erosion resilience to the car park, dog beach and adjacent public and private infrastructure.</li> <li>Maintains beach amonity page existing car park</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Significant seasonal variation in beach width adjacent to extended groynes (summer - wide beach to the south and narrow beach to the north, winter - narrow beach to the south and wide beach to the north).</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Maintains beach amenity hear existing car park.</li> <li>Maintains current access for beach and coastal structure maintenance at the existing car park location.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>May increase beach erosion further north, resulting in higher levels of renourishment or additional work.</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Longer groynes may allow for improvements to informal recreational activities (i.e. fishing).</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Longer and higher groynes may have a negative impact on visual amenity.</li> </ul>
	<ul><li>Likely to have a quicker approval process (no DA requirements).</li><li>No significant removal of dune vegetation.</li></ul>	<ul> <li>All options are reliant on regular beach monitoring and annual maintenance. Maintenance requirements are dependent on the intensity of winter storms and beach erosion.</li> </ul>
		<ul> <li>Existing car park does not meet current safety standards. Unsafe pedestrian crossing at existing car park entrance due to steep access road.</li> </ul>
Option 2	<ul> <li>Allows for natural beach erosion and recovery cycles to occur at the existing car park location without damage to infrastructure.</li> </ul>	• Risk of continued erosion at existing car park location resulting in ongoing renourishment and/or additional work.
	<ul> <li>Reduces the exposure of the car park to waves and sediment transport. New car park and toilet block will be easier and safer to access than existing facilities.</li> </ul>	New access will be required for beach and coastal structure maintenance at the existing car park location.
/	<ul> <li>Existing sandbag revetment provides erosion protection to the new car park.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>New car park construction will require the removal of established dune vegetation and associated clearing permits. Loss of this vegetation is permanent and the value of this land has not been accounted for.</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Short groynes allow bypassing of sand resulting in less impact to the north of Quinns.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Approval processes are likely to take longer due to replacement of facilities.</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Improved beach amenity and access to beach in front of new car park (south end of Fred Stubbs Park).</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>All options are reliant on regular beach monitoring and annual maintenance. Maintenance requirements are dependent on the intensity</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Additional visibility of car park may reduce potential for anti-social behaviour. Improved safety of pedestrian crossings at car park entrance due to improved visibility and level with road.</li> </ul>	of winter storms and beach erosion.
	<ul> <li>Rehabilitation of dune at car park location.</li> </ul>	Charlen the Eutrope

# Capital & Maintenance Costs

	Initial Capital Cost	Initial Capital Cost Breakdown	Net Present Value (50 year timeframe)
Option 1	/• \$5.4M	\$2.1M Groyne 2 extension	• \$13.0M
		<ul> <li>\$1.0M Groyne 3 extension</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Includes capital cost, annual beach re-</li> </ul>
		<ul> <li>\$1.1M Groyne 4</li> </ul>	nourishment and maintenance of groyne 1 (every 6 years), groynes 2 to 4 (at 20 years then
		<ul> <li>\$1.2M Beach Re-nourishment</li> </ul>	every 10 years)
			· · · · · ·
Option 2	• \$3.7M	\$1.1M New Car park	• \$9.8M
		<ul> <li>\$0.3M Removal of old car park and dune rehab</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Includes capital cost, annual beach re-</li> </ul>
		• \$1.1M Groyne 4	nourishment and maintenance of groynes 1 to 3 (every 6 years) and groyne 4 (at 20 years then
		<ul> <li>\$1.2 Beach Re-nourishment</li> </ul>	every 10 years)

![](_page_32_Picture_2.jpeg)

# Where to from here?

![](_page_33_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_33_Picture_2.jpeg)

#### Where to from here?

- Community Feedback
- Council Meeting
- Detailed Design
- Approvals and Tender
- Staged Construction

![](_page_34_Picture_6.jpeg)

![](_page_34_Picture_7.jpeg)

#### Community Information Session

- Cardno Presentation
- Breakout Sessions
- Formal Q/A Session
- Community Feedback

<u>QU</u>	INNS BEACH LONG TERM COASTAL MANAGEMENT OPTIONS
The City of management and expectat stage of the (	Wanneroo is currently considering coastal engineering options for the long term of the Quinns Rocks coastline. To ensure the chosen option aligns with community needs ions, please select your preferred option for further consideration in the detailed design Quinns Beach Long Term Coastal Management Study.
Community at the Gumb	Information Sessions will be held at 10:30am and 6:30pm Wednesday 27 April 2016 lossom Community Centre Sports Hall.
Refer to the 0	City's website for further information: anneroo.wa.gov.au/coastalmanagement
Which co	astal management option do you prefer?
	<b>Option 1</b> (Modification of Existing Groynes and Additional Groyne)
	Option 2 (Relocation of Carpark and Additional Groyne)
	Please tick (*) the relevant box
Details of a	
Any comme	ach option are provided on the attached information sheet. nts you wish to make in support or otherwise are welcomed below:
Any comme.	ach option are provided on the attached information sheet. nts you wish to make in support or otherwise are welcomed below:
Any comme	ach option are provided on the attached information sheet. nts you wish to make in support or otherwise are welcomed below: mments/information can be attached to this Comment Sheet.
Any comme Additional co Name(s)*:	ach option are provided on the attached information sheet. nts you wish to make in support or otherwise are welcomed below: mments/information can be attached to this Comment Sheet.
Any comme Additional co Name(s)*: Address/Sul	ach option are provided on the attached information sheet.  nts you wish to make in support or otherwise are welcomed below:  mments/information can be attached to this Comment Sheet.  burb*:
Additional co. Name(s)*: Address/Sul Email/Phone	ach option are provided on the attached information sheet.  nts you wish to make in support or otherwise are welcomed below:  mments/information can be attached to this Comment Sheet.  purb*:
Additional co Name(s)*: Address/Sul Email/Phone (*) Required F	ach option are provided on the attached information sheet.  nts you wish to make in support or otherwise are welcomed below:  mments/information can be attached to this Comment Sheet.  burb*:  ;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;
Additional co. Additional co. Name(s)*: Address/Sul Email/Phone (') Required F Please note t that is preser	ach option are provided on the attached information sheet.  nts you wish to make in support or otherwise are welcomed below:  mments/information can be attached to this Comment Sheet.  burb*:  p:  p:  p:  p:  p:  p:  p:  p:  p: p:
Additional coo Name(s)*: Address/Sul Email/Phone (*) Required F Please note t that is preser that is preser that is preser that is preser	ach option are provided on the attached information sheet. Ints you wish to make in support or otherwise are welcomed below: mments/information can be attached to this Comment Sheet. burb*:
Additional co Name(s)*: Address/Sul Email/Phone (*) Required F Please note t that is preser the date this This commer this/www.s	ach option are provided on the attached information sheet.  Ints you wish to make in support or otherwise are welcomed below:  Imments/information can be attached to this Comment Sheet.  Imments/information can be attached to the publishing any individual's details within any reporting the in reliation to this project. If you have provided contact details, the City will notify you of matter will be considered by Council. It sheet can also be completed online via the following link: Immerts/information Sheet to the City at the Community Information Sessions, via the online the attached reply paid envelope no later than <b>29 April 2016</b> .
Additional co. Name(s)*: Address/Sul Email/Phone (*) Required F Please note t that is preser that is preser	ach option are provided on the attached information sheet. Ints you wish to make in support or otherwise are welcomed below: mments/information can be attached to this Comment Sheet. burb*:

![](_page_35_Picture_6.jpeg)

# THANK YOU!

![](_page_36_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_36_Picture_2.jpeg)