

## **TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT**

**TO:** CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

**CC:** MANAGER INFRASTRUCTURE CAPITAL WORKS  
COORDINATOR CONSTRUCTION

**FROM:** DIRECTOR ASSETS

**FILE REF:** 24985V03 - 19/220722

**DATE:** 1 July 2019

---

### **TENDER 19064 - PROVISION OF MINOR WORKS FOR PARK ASSET RENEWALS 2019 – 2020, SOFTFALL AND SHADE SAILS ONLY**

---

#### **Issue**

To consider Tender No. 19064 for the provision of minor works relating to renewal of park assets within the City of Wanneroo.

#### **Background**

Tender 19064 - Park Asset Renewals 2019-20 forms part of a Recurring Program in place to ensure replacement of park assets which are approaching the end of their asset life. Only a portion of the 2019-20 Park Asset Renewal Program forms the scope of this tender, which is stipulated in the table below;

<b>No</b>	<b>Park Name</b>	<b>Suburb</b>	<b>Scope of Works</b>
1	Rotary Park	WANNEROO	Rubber softfall replacement – under the fort and northern swing section.
2	Alvarez Park	TAPPING	Rubber softfall replacement & installation of new shade sails.
3	Delamare Park	BANKSIA GROVE	Rubber softfall replacement.
4	Joseph Banks Park	BANKSIA GROVE	Rubber softfall replacement & installation of new shade sails.
5	Discovery Park	BANKSIA GROVE	Rubber softfall replacement & installation of new shade sails.
6	Koondoola Park	KOONDOOLA	Rubber softfall replacement.

### **Detail**

Tender 19064 for the Park Asset Renewal Program 2019/20 was advertised on the 20<sup>th</sup> of April 2019 and closed on Tuesday the 21<sup>st</sup> of May.

One addendum was issued:

- Addendum 1- Responses to tenderers queries.

Essential details of the proposed contract are as follows:

<b>Item</b>	<b>Detail</b>
Contract Form	Minor Works
Contract Type	Fixed Lump Sum Price
Contract Duration	12 months
Commencement Date	August 2019
Defects Liability Period	12 months
Extension Permitted	No
Rise and Fall	No

Tender submissions were received from the following companies:

- Astro Synthetic Surfaces Pty Ltd
- Moodie Outdoor Products Pty Ltd
- Perth Playground and Rubber
- West Coast Shade

On initial review of the tender submissions by the Tender Evaluation Panel (**TEP**), it was confirmed that all tender submissions were deemed to be conforming tenders.

All tenders were compliant with the General Conditions of Tendering and have been evaluated in accordance with the City's Tender evaluation process.

The TEP comprised of:

- Coordinator Construction – Chairperson.
- Occupational Safety & Health Officer – Voting member.
- Project Officer – Parks & Conservation – Voting member.
- Landscape Design & Construction Project Officer – Voting member.
- Coordinator Parks Contracts – Voting member.

### **Probity Oversight**

Oversight to the tender assessment process was undertaken by the City's Contracts Officer.

Tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan (PEP).

The PEP included the following selection criteria:

<b>Selection Criteria</b>	<b>Weighting</b>
Design	35%
Demonstrated Experience	30%
OSH	20%
Methodology and Timeframes	15%
Price	Non-weighted

Pricing is not included in the qualitative criteria and is considered as part of the overall value for money assessment. The minimum acceptable baseline for Qualitative Criteria is set at 50% with acceptable minimum scores required for each qualitative criterion.

Price was not included in the weighted criteria but was considered as part of the overall value for money assessment.

### ***Evaluation Criteria 1 - Design (35%)***

The tenderers' site specific designs were evaluated based on submission of drawings, technical notes, coverage, tender specification compliance and compliance with all Australian Standards provided with the tender documentation.

The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Perth Playground & Rubber	1
West Coast Shade	2
Astro Synthetic Surfaces Pty Ltd	3
Moodie Outdoor Products Pty Ltd	4

***Evaluation Criteria 2 - Demonstrated Relevant Experience (30%)***

The tenderers' relevant experience in demonstrating the achievement of the City's expectations as presented in their tender submissions were assessed in order to evaluate their capability and credentials to meet the requirements of the contract.

The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Perth Playground & Rubber	1
West Coast Shade	2
Astro Synthetic Surfaces Pty Ltd	2
Moodie Outdoor Products Pty Ltd	4

***Evaluation Criteria 3 - OSH (20%)***

Evidence of occupational safety, health, quality and environmental management systems were assessed from the tender submissions. The assessment was based on the tenderers' response to an Occupational Health and Safety Management System Questionnaire included within the tender documentation.

Based the response provided by the tenderers, the assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
West Coast Shade	1
Perth Playground & Rubber	2
Astro Synthetic Surfaces Pty Ltd	2
Moodie Outdoor Products Pty Ltd	4

***Evaluation Criteria 4 - Methodology and Timeframe (15%)***

The tenderer's methodology and timeframe as presented in their tender submission were assessed in order to evaluate their capacity to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tenderer's understanding of the project scope, current workload and the proposed Schedule of Works.

The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
West Coast Shade	1
Perth Playground & Rubber	1
Astro Synthetic Surfaces Pty Ltd	3
Moodie Outdoor Products Pty Ltd	4

### **Overall Qualitative Weighted Assessment and Ranking**

Tenderer's submissions were reviewed in accordance with the PEP with the following key observations:

- Price is not weighted and is included in the overall value for money assessment.
- The tenderers' submissions were evaluated in accordance with the selection criteria and were assessed as having the necessary resources, previous experience, capability and safety and quality management systems to undertake the tender.
- The tenderers' design proposals for both shade sails and rubber softfall complied with the scope of works.
- The Park Asset Renewal Program is to be issued as a Single Supplier contract.

The overall qualitative weighted assessment resulted in the following tenderer ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Perth Playground & Rubber	1
West Coast Shade	2
Astro Synthetic Surfaces Pty Ltd	3
Moodie Outdoor Products Pty Ltd	4

### **Evaluation Criteria 5 - Price**

Refer to Confidential Attachment 1 for the overall lump sum price assessment. The fixed lump sum price was applied in the overall value for money assessment for Tenderers that met the minimum Qualitative Criteria requirements.

### **Overall Assessment and Comment**

In accordance with the PEP, the proposals were assessed for both City and Australian Standard compliance whilst satisfying the overall value for money assessment.

West Coast Shade and Perth Playground & Rubber were the only tenderers to achieve qualitative criteria weighted scores over 50%. Perth Playground & Rubber did not meet the City's risk assessment for one of the criteria (Refer to Confidential Attachment 2).

Therefore, West Coast Shade is the only Tenderer assessed as being suitable for recommendation.

Assessment of West Coast Shade's value for money resulted in a lump sum price that was less than the budgeted cost for these works. As a result, it is recommended that the lump sum contract be awarded to West Coast Shade.

### **Consultation**

In accordance with *Section 3.51* of the *Local Act 1995* relating to minor construction works (General construction notice).

### **Statutory Compliance**

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.57 of the *Local Government Act 1995*. The tendering procedures and evaluation complied with the requirements of Part 4 of the *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996*.

### **Strategic Implications**

The proposal aligns with the following objective within the Strategic Community Plan 2026 - 2027:

#### **1. Society**

##### **1.1 Healthy and Active People**

1.1.1 Create opportunities that encourage community wellbeing and active and healthy lifestyles.

### **Enterprise Risk Management Considerations**

The enterprise risk management rating is moderate in accordance with Strategic Risk Register 2017-2018 section ST-S24 Strategic Asset Management.

### **Financial and Performance Risk**

#### **Financial Risk**

A financial risk assessment was undertaken as part of the tender evaluation process and the outcome of this independent assessment by Corporate Scorecard Pty Ltd advised that West Coast Shade has been assessed with a “Strong” financial capacity to meet the requirements of the contract.

#### **Performance Risk**

The recommended Tenderer has a minimum of 10 years’ experience in the Shade Sail industry while working with various local governments across Western Australia. In addition to that, the recommended tenderer has no disputes and claims history as stated in each submission.

Individual reference checks have also indicated that the recommended tenderer have a strong track record of working with local government for more than 5 years.

### **Social and Environmental Considerations**

Shade sails provide UV protection to both play equipment and its users. UV protection to park users also encourages increased frequency and duration of use by patrons which provides social and community benefits, additional interaction and participation from local residents in the broader community. The rubber softfall is a recycled product from old car tyres.

### **Broader Economic Impact Implications for the City of Wanneroo**

The recommended tenderer has some level of contribution in terms of labour and/or purchase goods which will directly benefit the local community. West Coast Shade are located in Fremantle. They will be engaging three locally based sub-contractors.

### **Policy Implications**

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of the City’s Purchasing Policy.

19064 – Provision of Minor Works for Park Asset Renewals – 2019/2020, Softfall and Shade Sails Only.

### Financial (Budget) Implications

The table below summarises the available funding – subject to Council's June Budget Approvals; for the Park Asset Renewal Program 2019/2020 and associated expense:

<b>PMO17015 Park Asset Renewal Program 2019/2020 PR-1910</b>		
<b>Description</b>	<b>Expenditure</b>	<b>Budget</b>
<b>Budget:</b>		
Capital Works Budget for 2019/2020		\$ 1,650,000
<b>Expenditure:</b>		
Expenditure incurred to date (2019/2020)	\$ 0	
Committed to date	\$ 0	
Project Management charges	\$ 115,500	
Works to be included in Tender 19063	\$ 1,100,000	
Tender 19064 (this Tender)	\$ 320,195	
<b>Total Expenditure</b>	<b>\$ 1,535,695</b>	
<b>Total Funding</b>		<b>\$ 1,650,000</b>
<b>Surplus funds to be used for other components of PR-1910</b>		<b>\$ 114,305</b>

19064 – Provision of Minor Works for Park Asset Renewals – 2019/2020, Softfall and Shade Sails Only.

**Recommendation**

That the Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.14 - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register for the awarding of tenders limited to \$1,000,000 ACCEPTS the tender submitted by West Coast Shade for Tender No. 19064 for the Park Asset Renewal Program 2019/2020, at a lump sum of \$320,195.00 as per the General Conditions of Tendering.

**APPROVED BY CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER**

SIGNATURE

DATE

6.7.19

*H. R. J.*