



City of
Wanneroo

TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT

TO: CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

CC: MANAGER ASSETS MAINTENANCE

FROM: DIRECTOR ASSETS

FILE REF: 37616: 19/357786

DATE: 28 November 2019

TENDER 19087
SUPPLY & INSTALLATION OF LIMESTONE BLOCKS & CAPPING

Issue

To consider Request for Tender No: 19087 for the Supply and Installation of Limestone Blocks & Capping to various locations within the City of Wanneroo for a period of two (2) years with two (2) twelve (12) month, or part thereof, options to extend.

Background

The City is seeking the provision of the Supply & Installation of Limestone Blocks, Capping and Associated Works for the purpose of improving the City's assets visually and to create safer public areas.

Work is carried out at various locations across the City and in accordance with maintenance and construction requirements. This contract is mainly utilised by Parks Maintenance and by Construction Projects for their annual Park Signs Program.

The current contract for limestone works 17054 expired 28 Aug 2019 and was not extended.

Detail

Tender No. 19087 for the Supply and Installation of Limestone Blocks & Capping was advertised 27 July 2019 and closed 3pm Tuesday 13 August 2019.

Addendum 1 - Clarification was issued 7 August 2019.

Essential details of the proposed contract are as follows:

Item	Detail
Contract Form	Goods and/or Services
Contract Type	Schedule of Rates
Contract Duration	Two Years
Commencement Date	November 2019
Completion	November 2021

Tender submissions were received from the following (listed alphabetically):

- The Trustee for the Twins Family Trust T/A C & S Mining Services ('C&S Mining Services')
- Hickey Construction Pty Ltd ('Hickey')
- Eighth St Pty Ltd T/A Ligna Construction ('Ligna')
- Total Landscape Redevelopment Services Pty Ltd ('Total')
- Corcreevy Pty Ltd T/A Tyrone Group ('Tyrone')

The Tender Evaluation Panel ("TEP") comprised:

- Specialist Parks Contracts
- Technical Officer - Horticulture
- Project Officer Construction
- Acting Coordinator Safety Systems

Probity Oversight

Oversight of the tender assessment process was undertaken by William Buck Consulting (WA) Pty Ltd and the City's Contracts Officer. Refer to the Confidential Attachment for the independent Probity Advisor Report.

Tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan ('PEP'). The PEP included the following selection criteria:

Item No	Description	Weighting
1	Price (assessed under Value for Money)	Not weighted
2	Demonstrated experience relative to this tender	40%
3	Methodology for Limestone Works Installation and Repairs	40%
4	Occupational Health & Safety	20%

Pricing is not included in the qualitative criteria and is considered as part of the overall value for money assessment. The minimum acceptable baseline for Qualitative Criteria is set at 50% with acceptable minimum scores required for each qualitative criterion.

The tender submission by C&S Mining Services was deemed to be non-confirming and was therefore excluded from the evaluation process.

Refer to the Confidential Attachment for documents relating to the Tender.

Refer to the Confidential Attachment for additional information concerning the value for money determination.

Evaluation Criteria 1: Demonstrated experience relative to this tender (40%)

The tenderer's relevant experience in demonstrating the achievement of meeting client expectations as presented in their tender submission were assessed in order to evaluate their capability to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tenderer's previous experience relevant to the services required. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Ligna	1
Total	1
Hickey	3
Tyrone	3

All tenderers achieved acceptable minimum scores for this evaluation criterion.

Evaluation Criteria 2: Methodology to Limestone Works Installation and Repairs (40%)

Assessment of this evaluation criterion considered the respondent's ability to demonstrate an understanding of the methodology required in order to manage the contract. Assessment of the criterion also considered the Respondent's staff resources and qualifications, vehicles and plant/equipment in order to meet the terms of the contract.

The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Hickey	1
Total	2
Ligna	3
Tyrone	4

Hickey, Total and Ligna achieved acceptable minimum scores for this evaluation criterion.

Evaluation Criteria 4: Occupational Health & Safety (20%)

Evidence of safety management policies and practices was assessed from the tender submissions. The assessment for safety management was based on the tenderer's responses to the Occupational Health and Safety Management System Questionnaire included within the tender documentation.

All tenderers provided details of their safety management systems with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Ligna	1
Hickey	2
Total	3
Tyrone	4

Ligna and Hickey achieved acceptable minimum scores for this evaluation criterion.

Qualitative Weighted Assessment and Ranking

Tender submissions were review in accordance with the PEP with the following key observations:

- Price is not weighted and is included in the overall value for money assessment.
- The tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the qualitative criteria and weightings as detailed in the Procurement and Evaluation Plan and were assessed against the necessary experience, methodology and safety management systems to undertake the tender.

The overall qualitative weighted assessment resulted in the following tenderer ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Ligna	1
Hickey	2
Total	2
Tyrone	4

Evaluation Criteria 1 - Pricing for the Goods & Services Offered (not weighted)

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based pricing against a number of parks, playground and signage scenarios using the schedule of rates provided with the tender documentation. The assessment has resulted in the following ranking

Tenderer	Ranking
Total	1
Ligna	2
Hickey	3
Tyrone	4

Overall Value for Money Assessment and Comment

While the submission from Total was ranked equal second in the overall weighted assessment, they did not achieve the acceptable minimum score for the Occupational Health and Safety criterion; and therefore cannot be considered further for the overall value for money. The tender submissions from Ligna and Hickey achieved acceptable baseline scores for all Qualitative Criteria and were assessed for value for money. The tender submission from Ligna satisfied the overall value for money to the City of Wanneroo and is therefore recommended as the successful Tenderer.

Consultation

Not applicable

Statutory Compliance

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.57 of the Local Government Act 1995. The tendering procedures and evaluation complied with the requirements of Part 4 of the Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996.

Strategic Implications

The proposal aligns with the following objective with the Strategic Community Plan 2017/18 - 2026/27:

SOCIETY

1.1 HEALTHY & ACTIVE PEOPLE

1.1.1 Create opportunities that encourage community wellbeing and active healthy lifestyles.

1.1.2 Facilitate opportunities within the City to access peak and elite activities.

Enterprise Risk Management Considerations

There are existing Corporate risks within the City's existing risk registers which relate to the issues contained in this report.

The following risks relating to the issues contained within this report have been identified and considered within the City's Corporate Risk Register:

Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-O07 Purchasing	Moderate
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Corporate Strategy & Performance	Manage
Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-O17 Financial Management	Moderate
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Corporate Strategy & Performance	Manage
Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-O17 Financial Management	Moderate
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Corporate Strategy & Performance	Manage

Financial and Performance Risk

An independent financial and performance risk assessment was undertaken as part of the tender evaluation process and the outcome of this assessment advised that Ligna Construction has been assessed with a 'sound' financial capacity to meet the requirements of the contract and no additional risk mitigation steps are required.

Refer to the Confidential Attachment for the Financial and Performance Assessment.

Social, Environmental and Sustainable Considerations

The City's standard schedule was included in the Request for Tender documentation. Ligna's submission states the company follows EMS principles and is conscious of their social impacts of its activities on the environment.

Broader Economic Impact Implications for the City of Wanneroo

The City's standard schedule was included in the Request for Tender documentation. Ligna have stated that five employees live locally, there will be no need to employ additional staff and all sub-contractors are locally based.

Policy Implications

Tenders were invited and assessed in accordance with the City's Purchasing Policy.

Financial (Budget) Implications

The costs associated with the provision of the Supply & Installation of Limestone Blocks, Capping and Associated Works are included in the Annual Parks Maintenance Operational Budgets. The estimated value of work over the initial 2 year term of the Contract is expected to be in the order of \$130,492.00.

Recommendation

That the Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.14 – Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register ACCEPTS the tender submitted by Eighth St Pty Ltd T/A Ligna Construction, for Tender 19087, for the Supply and Installation of Limestone Blocks & Capping. The contract is for an initial two (2) year term, as per the schedule of rates contained within the tender submission. There are two (2), twelve (12) month, or part thereof options to extend at the City's discretion.

SUBMITTED BY SPECIALIST PARKS CONTRACTS




SIGNATURE

28/11/19

DATE

REVIEWED BY MANAGER CONTRACTS & PROCUREMENT



SIGNATURE

28/11/19

DATE

ENDORSED BY MANAGER ASSET MAINTENANCE



SIGNATURE

28/11/2019

DATE

RECOMMENDED BY DIRECTOR ASSETS



SIGNATURE

29.11.19

DATE

APPROVED BY CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER



SIGNATURE

4.12.19

DATE