

## **TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT**

**TO:** CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

**CC:** COASTAL OFFICER  
SPECIALIST COASTAL ENGINEER  
ACTING MANAGER ASSETS MAINTENANCE

**FROM:** DIRECTOR ASSETS

**FILE REF:** 20/12876 [PR 2672]

**DATE:** 29 January 2020

---

### **TENDER 19198: UPGRADE OF CLAYTONS BEACH ACCESS - MINDARIE**

---

#### **Issue**

To consider Tender No: 19198 for the Upgrade of Claytons Beach Access - Mindarie.

#### **Background**

Claytons Beach Access – Mindarie forms part of the City's Beach Access Ways Upgrade Programme, which includes a number of priority beach access ways requiring replacement based on structural condition assessment by engineering consultant AECOM in 2015.

The existing beach access way consists of a number of sections including both concrete and timber stairs. The lower timber staircase underwent emergency repairs following an erosion event in August 2018 which undermined and severely damaged the bottom half of the structure. Additionally, this staircase is at the end of its design life and requires replacement as it presents a public safety risk in its current condition. Replacement of the lower timber staircase is necessary to ensure a continued safe access to Claytons Beach.

Claytons Beach safety was assessed by Surf Life Saving WA (SLSWA). Recommendations from SLSWA were not supportive of providing any additional carpark and amenities at this beach access location, such that the usage of a 'persistent rip currents' beach is discouraged. Hence, the proposed works under Tender 19198 do not involve the installation of any additional infrastructure. Construction works will only replace the already existing staircase to ensure that safe public access to Claytons Beach is maintained.

A detailed design of the new beach access structure was completed in 2018/19 by Engineering Consultant, M P Rogers & Associates Pty Ltd, which included consideration of all available data, studies and the City's recent Coastal Hazard Risk Management and Adaptation Plan (CHRMAP).

The necessary approvals for the works were received in October 2019 from the relevant State Government authorities. These include: Clearing Permit from Department of Water and Environmental Regulation (DWER), and confirmation of no further Planning, Crown Land, and Aboriginal Heritage requirements from Department of Planning, Lands, and Heritage (DPLH).

Tender 19198 Upgrade of Claytons Beach Access - Mindarie

Qualitative Criteria is set at 50% with acceptable minimum scores required for each qualitative criterion indicated with \* above.

All received tenders were deemed to be conforming and were included in the evaluation process.

### **Pricing for the Works Offered (Not Weighted)**

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the lump sum pricing provided by each tenderer. Please refer to the Confidential Attachment for details on lump sum pricing, pricing comparison, and detailed pricing analysis.

Based on the information provided in each submission, tenderers have been ranked as per the table below:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
PML Installations	1
VHM Solutions	2
Advanteering	3
EI	4
ENVIRO	5
NAMS	6

### **Evaluation Criteria 1 - Sustainable Procurement (10%)**

- **Environmental Considerations (5%)**

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on tenderers' Environmental policy and practices.

The assessment of this criterion resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Advanteering	1
EI	1
VHM Solutions	3
PML Installations	3
NAMS	5
ENVIRO	6

- **Buy Local (5%)**

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided, detailing the following information:

- Purchasing arrangements through local businesses;
- Location of tenderer's offices and workshops;
- Residential addresses of staff and subcontractors; and
- Requirement for new employees arising from award of the contract.

The assessment of this criterion resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
EI	1
Advanteering	2
VHM Solutions	3
PML Installations	4
NAMS	5
ENVIRO	6

## Tender 19198 Upgrade of Claytons Beach Access - Mindarie

All tenderers provided details of their safety management systems, apart from PML Installations, who only provided an OHSAS 18001:2007 certificate.

This criterion resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Advanteering	1
EI	2
NAMS	2
ENVIRO	4
VHM Solutions	5
PML Installations	6

The top 5 ranked tenderers achieved an acceptable minimum score for this evaluation criterion.

### Overall Qualitative Weighted Assessment and Ranking

Tenderer's submissions were reviewed in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan with the following key observations:

- Price is not weighted and is included in the overall value for money assessment.
- The tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the qualitative criteria and weightings as detailed in the Procurement and Evaluation Plan, and were assessed against sustainable procurement as well as the necessary experience, methodology and safety management systems required to undertake the contract requirements.
- Advanteering achieved the highest ranking for qualitative criteria relating to Demonstrated Experience, Methodology, and Safety Management Systems.

The overall qualitative weighted assessment resulted in the following tenderer ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Advanteering*	1
EI*	2
NAMS*	3
PML Installations	4
ENVIRO	5
VHM Solutions	6

### Value for Money Assessment

\*The submissions received from Advanteering, EI and NAMS were the only tenders which met the minimum requirements for all qualitative criteria and therefore, qualified for consideration to the value for money assessment. The combined assessment of Price vs Qualitative Scores resulted in the following tenderer ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Advanteering	1
EI	2
NAMS	3

### Enterprise Risk Management Considerations

<b>Risk Title</b>	<b>Risk Rating</b>
ST-S06 Climate Change	High
<b>Accountability</b>	<b>Action Planning Option</b>
Director Planning and Sustainability	Manage

<b>Risk Title</b>	<b>Risk Rating</b>
CO-022 Environmental Management	High
<b>Accountability</b>	<b>Action Planning Option</b>
Director Planning and Sustainability	Manage

The above risks relating to the issue contained within this report have been identified and considered within the City's Strategic/Corporate risk registers. Action plans have been developed to manage/mitigate/accept this risk to support existing management systems.

### Financial and Performance Risk

#### Financial Risk

A financial risk assessment was undertaken as part of the tender evaluation process and the outcome of this independent assessment by Corporate Scorecard Pty Ltd advised that Advantearing - Civil Engineers Pty Ltd has been assessed with a strong financial capacity to meet the requirements of the contract.

#### Performance Risk

Advantearing has demonstrated the capacity and experience to deliver this contract effectively, based on their previous contracts with other Local Councils. Advantearing has had no recent disputes.

Independent reference checks have also indicated that the recommended tenderer has completed recent similar works to acceptable standards and within agreed timeframes and budgets.

### Social and Environmental Considerations

The City's standard schedule was included in the Request for Tender documentation. Advantearing's submission states the company follows EMS principles and is conscious of the social impacts of its activities on the environment.

### Broader Economic Impact Implications for the City of Wanneroo

Advantearing's response to the City's Buy Local Questionnaire has identified local sourcing of goods, such as concrete material, as well as 25% of employees who live locally.

### Purchasing Policy Implications

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of the City's Purchasing Policy.

**Recommendation**

That the Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.14 - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register for the awarding of tenders ACCEPTS the tender submitted by Advantearing – Civil Engineers Pty Ltd for Tender 19198, for the Upgrade of Claytons Beach Access – Mindarie, at a Fixed Lump Sum of \$148,988.

**SUBMITTED BY COASTAL OFFICER**

  
SIGNATURE

29/01/2020  
DATE

**REVIEWED BY MANAGER CONTRACTS & PROCUREMENT**

  
SIGNATURE

29/1/2020  
DATE

**ENDORSED BY ACTING MANAGER ASSETS MAINTENANCE**

  
SIGNATURE


29-01-2020  
DATE

**1P RECOMMENDED BY DIRECTOR ASSETS**

  
SIGNATURE

31/1/2020  
DATE

**APPROVED BY CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER**

  
SIGNATURE

31.01.2020  
DATE