

## **TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT**

**TO:** CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

**CC:** MANAGER INFRASTRUCTURE CAPITAL WORKS

**FROM:** DIRECTOR ASSETS

**FILE REF:** 20/456461

**DATE:** 18 November 2020

---

**TENDER 20194: SUPPLY, INSTALLATION & COMMISSIONING OF  
FLOODLIGHTING TO RIDGEWOOD PARK, RIDGEWOOD and PALOMA PARK,  
MARANGAROO**

---

### **Issue**

To consider Tender No: 20194 for the Supply, Installation and Commissioning of Floodlights to Ridgewood Park, Ridgewood and Paloma Park, Marangaroo.

### **Background**

#### Ridgewood Park, Ridgewood

The sporting field located at Ridgewood Park accommodates a senior Australian Football League (AFL) club, Cricket club and a Little Athletics club and is classified as a District Sports Facility. In 2017, the Quinns Districts Amateur Football Club requested an increase of the standard of floodlighting at the Reserve from the current 50 lux training level to amateur large ball sport competition level of 100 lux to enable the club to fixture night games for its current teams. This increase of the floodlighting level was also captured within the City's Active Reserve Master Plan.

The club has secured a commitment of \$190,000 from the Federal Government to upgrade the sports floodlighting at Ridgewood Reserve. Council accepted the request to increase the standard of floodlighting and accepted the grant funding at the 15<sup>th</sup> October 2019 Council meeting (CE01-10).

The Sports Floodlighting Policy requires District level sports floodlighting to be 100 lux and the luminaries to be LED. Review of the capacity of the existing poles at Ridgewood Park was completed and the existing lighting poles were found to have insufficient structural capacity to accommodate an upgrade to 100 lux LED luminaries.

The proposed construction works consist of engaging an electrical contractor to supply and install new floodlight poles, with 100 lux LED lighting, to the sports field. Additional works include provision of a new site main switchboard, removal of existing redundant floodlight poles and conduits. Construction is anticipated to be completed by the end of June 2021.

### Paloma Park, Marangaroo

Paloma Park consists of a larger north oval and smaller south oval. The north oval accommodates an AFL club and a Cricket club while the south oval accommodates a Soccer club and Junior AFL club. The Active Reserve Master Plan Report identified the need to place floodlighting to the sporting fields in both ovals. The installation of floodlights will allow the incumbent sporting clubs to run evening training sessions. For floodlighting upgrade purposes Paloma Park north and south ovals are considered as one park which classifies the Park as a District sports facility.

As a part of the Local Roads and Community Infrastructure Projects, the City was able to secure a commitment of \$370,000 from the Federal Government to upgrade the sports floodlighting at Paloma Reserve.

The works consist of engaging an electrical contractor to supply and install new floodlight poles, with 100 lux LED lighting, to the northern sports field.

Design and documentation of the parks were completed in the 2019/2020 and early part of 2020/2021 financial years with funding allocated in the Capital Works Budget. For the construction stage, funding is allocated in the 2020/2021 Capital Works under PR-2989 (for Ridgewood Park) and PR-4214 (for Paloma Park) which shall be completed by the end of June 2021 with a target to complete as early as possible as requested by the sporting clubs in order to commence winter season sports (AFL).

### **Detail**

Tender 20194 for the Provision of the Supply, Installation and Commissioning of Floodlights to Ridgewood Park, Ridgewood and Paloma Park, Marangaroo was advertised on Wednesday 9 and Saturday 12 September 2020 and closed on Tuesday 29 September 2020. Two (2) addenda were issued which did not impact the scope of works included in the original tender document. A mandatory site meeting was held on Wednesday, 16 September 2020 at 9.00am. The site meeting commenced at Paloma Park, Marangaroo and continued to Ridgewood Park, Ridgewood.

The Tender was offered as Separable Portion contracts with the portion for each site eligible to be awarded to one or more tenderers.

- Separable Portion A – Ridgewood Park Oval, Ridgewood
- Separable Portion B – Paloma Park North Oval, Marangaroo
- Separable Portion C (Optional) – Paloma Park South Oval, Marangaroo

The tender noted that award for both contracts were subject to funding approvals. Each Separable Portion for Paloma Park (North and South) also offered two options for consideration, being 50 lux lighting level or 100 lux lighting level.

Essential details of the proposed contract are as follows:

Item	Detail
Contract Form	Minor Works
Contract Type	Lump Sum (Separable Portion)
Contract Duration	10 months
Commencement Date	20 November 2020
Expiry Date	12 months after Practical Completion
Extension Permitted	No
Rise and Fall	Does not apply

Tender submissions were received from the following companies:

Legal Name	Trading Name	Abbreviation
AICA Energy	AICA Energy	AICA
Future Power WA Pty Ltd	Future Power	Future Power
Gillmore Electrical Services Pty Ltd	Gillmore Electrical	Gillmore Electrical
Stiles Electrical & Communication Services	Stiles Electrical	Stiles Electrical
Wesco	Wesco	Wesco

The Tender Evaluation panel comprised:

- Project Manager – Infrastructure Projects
- Coordinator Facility Projects
- Community Facilities Planning Officer
- Coordinator Safety Systems
- Electrical Design Consultant

### Probity Oversight

Oversight to the tender assessment process was undertaken by the City's Contracts Officer.

Tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan (PEP) which included the following selection criteria:

Item No	Description	Weighting
1	Price (assessed under Value for Money)	Not Weighted
2	Sustainable Procurement	25%
3	*Organisational & Key Personnel Experience	20%
4	*Methodology & Meet Project Timeline	20%
5	*OSH	20%
6	Innovation	15%

Pricing is not included in the qualitative criteria and is considered as part of the overall value for money assessment.

Tenderers must achieve a minimum acceptable qualitative score (as determined by the City) and for each of the qualitative criteria detailed above (\*) to be considered for further evaluation. Tender 20194 consisted of three Separable Portions, for the purpose of this tender all qualitative criteria were assessed under a combined basis.

**Conforming & Non-Conforming Tenders**

All tenderers submitted for all Separable Portions. The tender submissions received from Future Power, Gillmore Electrical and Stiles Electrical were deemed conforming and progressed to further evaluation. Tender submission from AICA did not include confirmation of receiving Addenda 1 & 2 during the tender advertising period. Following clarification and a request for a response from the City, AICA Energy withdrew their tender submission. WESCO's tender submission was non-conforming as they did not provide any supporting information for the qualitative criteria. The tender submissions for AICA Energy and WESCO were not considered for further evaluation.

**Evaluation Criteria 2 – Sustainable Procurement (25%)**

**Environmental Considerations (5%)**

Assessment of this criterion considered each tenderer's credentials of any environmental claims of the good and/or services being submitted in this Tender.

Tenderer	Ranking
Future Power	1
Gillmore Electrical	2
Stiles Electrical	3

**Buy Local (Broader Economic Impact Implications for the City of Wanneroo) (15%)**

This criterion assesses the commitment and engagement of the Tenderer to providing economic stimulation to local business.

Tenderer	Ranking
Stiles Electrical	1
Gillmore Electrical	1
Future Power	3

**Reconciliation Action Plan (RAP) (2.5%)**

Evaluation of this criterial assesses the Tenderer's organisational commitment to City's Reconciliation Action Plan.

Tenderer	Ranking
Gillmore Electrical	1
Future Power	1
Stiles Electrical	3

**Access & Inclusion Plan (AIP) (2.5%)**

This criterion assesses the Tenderer’s commitment to engage people in the community with disabilities.

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Gillmore Electrical	1
Future Power	1
Stiles Electrical	3

The assessment of the Sustainable Procurement overall criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Gillmore Electrical	1
Stiles Electrical	2
Future Power	2

**Evaluation Criteria 3 – Organisation and Personnel Experience (20%)**

The tenderer’s relevant organisational experience and the experience of proposed key personnel in demonstrating the achievement of meeting client expectations, as presented in their tender submission, were assessed in order to evaluate their capability to meet the requirements of the contract. The assessment of this criterion considered the tendering entity’s credentials, project examples with similar scope, lessons learnt, challenges, resolutions and the identified personnel’s capacity to meet the requirements of the contract.

The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Future Power	2
Gillmore Electrical	2

All tenderers achieved an acceptable minimum score for this evaluation criterion.

**Evaluation Criteria 4 – Methodology and Project Timeframe (20%)**

The tenderer’s demonstrated methodology and construction program, presented in their tender submission, were assessed in order to evaluate their understanding of the requirements of the tender documentation and their proposed resourcing to manage the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tenderer’s proposed services, allocation of resources, proposed Gantt / construction program schedule and methodology statement in relation to how the work will be undertaken. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following tender ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Gillmore Electrical	2
Future Power	3

All tenderers achieved an acceptable minimum score for this evaluation criterion.

**Evaluation Criteria 5 – Occupational Health And Safety (OHS) Management System (20%)**

Evidence of safety and quality management policies and practices were assessed from the tender submissions. The assessment for safety management was based on the tenderer’s responses to an Occupational Health and Safety Management System Questionnaire included within the tender documentation.

All conforming tenderer’s provided details of their safety management systems with the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Future Power	1
Stiles Electrical	2
Gillmore Electrical	3

All tenderers achieved an acceptable minimum score for this evaluation criterion.

**Evaluation Criteria 6 – Innovation (15%)**

The tenderer’s demonstrated examples of innovation in construction, presented in their tender submission, were assessed in order to evaluate their recommendations to improve value for the project. Assessment of this criterion considered the tenderer’s proposed innovations, supporting information and experience in innovative solutions on previous projects. The City requested innovative solutions to address cable theft and improved lighting for passive use. The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following tender ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Future Power	2
Gillmore Electrical	2

**Overall Qualitative Weighted Assessment and Ranking**

The overall qualitative criteria weighted assessment resulted in the following tenderer ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Gillmore Electrical	2
Future Power	3

**Tendered Lump Sum Price Ranking**

Tenderers’ price submissions were reviewed and the **Confidential Memo (attached)** provides the detailed price information. Price comparisons were undertaken for both sites for the 100 lux options, Ridgewood Park (Separable Portion A), Paloma Park North (Separable Portion B, Option 2B) and Paloma Park South (Separable Portion C, Option 2C).

The price assessment for Ridgewood Park (Separable Portion A) resulted in the following tenderer ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Gillmore Electrical	2
Future Power	3

The price assessment for Paloma Park North oval (Separable Portion B, Option 2B) resulted in the following tenderer ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Gillmore Electrical	1
Future Power	2
Stiles Electrical	3

For Paloma Park South Oval (Separable Portion C, Option 2C) a review of the tendered prices found that there is insufficient project budget to award Separable Portion C at this time.

#### **Value for Money Assessment**

On assessment of the tendered prices and the overall qualitative assessment results, the Evaluation Panel determined the best value for money to recommend award of the two sites as separate contracts. For Paloma Park North Oval the option for an installation with 100 lux lighting, in line with the City's Sports Floodlighting Policy, was assessed.

#### Ridgewood Park, Ridgewood:

The individual assessment of Price vs Qualitative Scores for Ridgewood Park (Separable Portion A) resulted in the following tender ranking (highest to lowest):

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Gillmore Electrical	2
Future Power	3

#### Paloma Park North Oval, Marangaroo:

The individual assessment of Price vs Qualitative Scores for Paloma Park North Oval (Separable Portion B, Option 2B) resulted in the following tender ranking (highest to lowest):

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Gillmore Electrical	1
Future Power	2
Stiles Electrical	3

## **Overall Assessment and Comment**

### Ridgewood Park, Ridgewood

The tender submission from Stiles Electrical achieved the highest value for money ranking for Ridgewood Park and satisfied the qualitative assessment in accordance with the assessment criteria and weightings as detailed in the Procurement and Evaluation Plan. Stiles Electrical is therefore recommended as the successful tenderer for Ridgewood Park Oval (Separable Portion A).

The assessment and evaluation of Stiles Electricals' tender submission also noted the following:

- Stiles Electricals' tender price is highly competitive and is within the project budget;
- Stiles Electrical has indicated within their tender a strong and large team, capable of successfully delivering this type of project;
- Stiles Electrical has performed a number of sports floodlighting projects within the City of Wanneroo and the Perth metropolitan area using LED technology;
- Stiles Electrical have demonstrated safety systems in place which meet the City's Occupational Health and Safety Management System assessment requirements;
- Previous works undertaken for the City of Wanneroo indicates timelines for completion of projects, project management, quality of work and overall delivery of projects is positive; and,
- The tender requested innovative solutions and Stiles Electrical provided well documented alternatives to improve the value for money delivery of the project.

### Paloma Park, Marangaroo

The tender submission from Gillmore Electrical achieved the highest value for money ranking for Paloma Park North Oval and satisfied the qualitative assessment in accordance with the assessment criteria and weightings detailed in the Procurement Evaluation Plan. Gillmore Electrical is therefore recommended as the successful tenderer for the Paloma Park North Oval (Separable Portion B).

The assessment and evaluation of Gillmore Electricals' tender submission also noted the following:

- Gillmore Electrical's tender price was highly competitive and is within the project budget ;
- Gillmore has undertaken a number of sports floodlighting projects of similar scale and scope of works with the City of Wanneroo and the City of Swan;
- Gillmore Electrical have demonstrated safety systems in place which meet the City's Occupational Health and Safety Management System assessment requirements; and
- Gillmore Electrical has submitted a detailed and comprehensive methodology for the supply and installation of the sports floodlights, demonstrating a clear understanding of the scope of works required.



## Consultation

Consultation with the City's internal stakeholders has been undertaken throughout the design process to ensure that requirements are met.

As per the City's Community Engagement Plans, consultation was undertaken for both floodlighting projects including a four week public comment period which concluded on 30 August 2020 for Ridgewood Park and 6 September 2020 for Paloma Park. The City received one (1) query for Ridgewood Park that regarding the position of one of the floodlighting poles. In response to this query there were no changes to the project scope and a response has been provided to the customer.

Consultation and communication shall be continued as a part of the construction stage of the project, with a particular focus on minimising the impact on site and maintaining a safe work environment.

## Statutory Compliance

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.57 of the *Local Government Act 1995*. The tendering procedures and evaluation complied with the requirements of Part 4 of the *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996*.

As confirmed with the City's Approval Services, the WA Department of Planning, Lands and Heritage confirms that a Development Approval is not required for the installation of sports floodlighting at the aforementioned parks.

As confirmed with the City's Approval Services a building permit application will need to be submitted by the electrical contractors as part of their scope of works.

## Strategic Implications

The proposal aligns with the following objective with the Strategic Community Plan 2017 – 2027:

1. *Society – Healthy, safe, vibrant and connected communities*
  - 1.1. *Healthy & Active People*
    - 1.1.1. *“Create opportunities that encourage community wellbeing and active healthy lifestyles”*

## Enterprise Risk Management Considerations

<b>Risk Title</b>	<b>Risk Rating</b>
CO-O20 Productive Communities	Moderate
<b>Accountability</b>	<b>Action Planning Option</b>
Director Community & Place	Manage

<b>Risk Title</b>	<b>Risk Rating</b>
CO-O23 Safety of Community	Low
<b>Accountability</b>	<b>Action Planning Option</b>
Director Community and Place	Manage

The above risks relating to the issues contained within this report have been identified and considered within the City's corporate risk register. Action plans have been developed to manage these risks to improve the existing management systems.

### **Financial and Performance Risk**

#### Financial Risk

A financial risk assessment was undertaken as part of the tender evaluation process and the outcome of this independent assessment advised to meet the requirements of the contract, that:

- Stiles Electrical have been assessed with a 'Strong' financial capacity; and,
- Gillmore Electrical has been assessed with a 'Sound' financial capacity.

#### Performance Risk

**Stiles Electrical** has carried out several floodlighting projects for the City in the past, recently for Koondoola and Hainsworth Parks with similar complexity and value. Feedback from the Project Managers who managed previous projects has been positive.

**Gillmore Electrical** has also carried out floodlighting projects for the City in the past. Feedback from the Project Managers who managed these projects has been positive.

### **Policy Implications**

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of the City's Purchasing Policy.

### **Financial (Budget) Implications**

#### Ridgewood Park, Ridgewood

The table below summarises the available funding for the project, current expenditures and the recommended tender price by **Sites Electrical** for the Provision of Minor Works for the supply, installation and commissioning of floodlighting at Ridgewood Park, Ridgewood and associated expenses:

**PR-2989 PMO19054 Upgrade Sports Floodlighting Ridgewood Park, Ridgewood**

Description	Expenditure	Budget
<b>Budget:</b>		
Capital Works Budget for FY 2020/21		
• Municipal funds		\$185,000
• Grant funds (Federal Department of Health)		\$190,000
<b>Expenditure:</b>		
Expenditure incurred to date	\$8,392	
Commitments	\$7,278	
Project Management and administration fees	\$20,000	
Professional fees (uncommitted)	\$3,000	
RFT 20194 Separable Portion A – Supply, Installation and Commissioning of floodlighting at Ridgewood Park, Ridgewood	\$283,459	
Contractor fees (uncommitted) for works provision of community and dog-walking lighting to Ridgewood Oval.	\$10,000	
Construction Contingency (for rock excavation)	\$20,000	
Construction Contingency (general)	\$22,871	
<b>Total Expenditure (estimate)</b>	<b>\$375,000</b>	
<b>Total Funding</b>		<b>\$375,000</b>

**Paloma Park, Marangaroo**

The table below summarises the available funding for the project, current expenditures and the recommended tender price by **Gillmore Electrical** for the Provision of Minor Works for the supply, installation and commissioning of floodlighting at Paloma Park, Marangaroo and associated expenses:

**PR-4214 PMO19092 Upgrade Sports Floodlighting Paloma Park, Marangaroo**

Description	Expenditure	Budget
<b>Budget:</b>		
Allocated Capital Works Budget for 2019/20 (PR-4214)		\$31,000
Allocated Capital Works Budget for 2020/21 (PR-4214)		\$370,000
<b>Expenditure:</b>		
Expenditure incurred to date	\$33,751	
Commitments	\$1,050	
Project Management fees	\$20,000	
Professional fees (uncommitted)	\$5,000	
RFT 20194 Separable Portion 2B – Supply, Installation and Commissioning of 100 lux LED floodlighting at Paloma Park, Marangaroo – North Oval	\$259,560	
Contractor fees (uncommitted) for works provision of community and dog-walking lighting to Paloma Park North Oval.	\$10,000	
Construction Contingency (general)	\$71,639	
<b>Total Expenditure (estimate)</b>	<b>\$401,000</b>	
<b>Total Funding</b>		<b>\$401,000</b>

Tender 20194 Supply & Installation of Sports Floodlights to Ridgewood and Paloma Parks

Due to insufficient project budget to award Paloma Park South Oval (Separable Portion C, Option 2C) at this time, all offers are declined for that Separable Portion and quotations will be invited once sufficient funding has been allocated for the works.

**Recommendation:**

**That the Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.14 - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register for the awarding of tenders:**

**ACCEPTS the tender submitted by Stiles Electrical for Tender 20194 for the Supply, Installation and Commissioning of floodlighting at Ridgewood Park, Ridgewood for Separable Portion A (Ridgewood Park, Ridgewood), as a Fixed Lump Sum Price of \$283,458.74 (exc GST) and in accordance with the terms and conditions specified in the tender document; and**

**ACCEPTS the tender submitted by Gillmore Electrical for Tender 20194 for the Supply, Installation and Commissioning of floodlighting at Paloma Park, Marangaroo for Separable Portion B, Option 2B (Paloma Park, Marangaroo North Oval 100 lux), as a Fixed Lump Sum Price of \$259,560 (exc GST) and in accordance with the terms and conditions specified in the tender document; and**

**DECLINES all tenders for Separable Portion C (Paloma Park, Marangaroo South Oval) of Tender 20194 for the Supply, Installation and Commissioning of floodlighting.**