



TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT

TO: ACTING CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

CC: MANAGER INFRASTRUCTURE CAPITAL WORKS

FROM: DIRECTOR ASSETS

FILE REF: 21/207600

DATE: 6 JULY 2021

TENDER 21106 Supply, Installation & Commissioning of Floodlighting at Ferrara Park, Girrawheen and Belhaven Park, Quinns Rocks

Issue

To consider Tender No: 21106 for the Supply, installation and commissioning of floodlighting at Ferrara Park Girrawheen (PR-4213) and Belhaven Park Quinns Rocks (PR-4253).

Background

Ferrara Park, Girrawheen

The sporting field located at Ferrara Park accommodates; soccer, senior Australian football and cricket and is used by the Australia Karen Organisation WA Inc., Gortankaku Community Association WA Inc., and the Roseworth Primary School which is located to the south east of the reserve. Ferrara Oval is classified as a Neighbourhood Reserve and The Active Reserve Masterplan Report identified the need to upgrade floodlighting to the sporting field.

The City has secured a grant of \$114,219 from the Department of Local Government, Sport and Cultural Industries, Community Sporting and Recreation Facilities Fund (CSRFF) to upgrade the sports floodlighting at Ferrara Park.

Belhaven Park, Quinns Rocks

This neighbourhood reserve has shared use with Quinns Beach Primary School, Quinns Rocks Junior Cricket Club and Little Athletics Club. Belhaven Park consists of a larger east oval and smaller west oval.

As a part of the Local Roads and Community Infrastructure Projects, the City was able to secure a commitment of \$335,700 from the Federal Government to upgrade the sports floodlighting at Belhaven Park.

The proposed construction works at both Ferrara Park and Belhaven Park consist of engaging an electrical contractor to supply and install new floodlight poles, with 50 lux LED lighting, to the sports field. The provision of 50 lux lighting is in line with the City's Sports Floodlighting Policy requirements for Neighbourhood Reserves. Additional works include provision of passive surveillance / dog walking lights (LED). Construction

is anticipated to be completed by the end of December 2021 for Belhaven Park and the end of March 2022 for Ferrara Park.

Design and documentation of the floodlighting works were completed in the 2020/2021 Financial Year and funding was allocated in the Capital Works Budget. For the construction stage, funding is allocated in the 2021/2022 Capital Works under PR-4213 (for Ferrara Park) and PR-4253 (for Belhaven Park).

Detail

Tender 21106 for the Supply, installation and commissioning of floodlighting at Ferrara Park Girrawheen and Belhaven Park Quinns Rocks was advertised on 22 May 2021 and closed on 15 June 2021. One addendum was issued which did not impact the scope of works included in the original tender document. A mandatory site meeting was held on Thursday, 3 June 2021 at 10.00am. The site meeting commenced at Ferrara Park, Girrawheen and continued to Belhaven Park, Quinns Rocks.

The Tender was offered as Separable Portion contracts with the portion for each site eligible to be awarded to one or more Tenderers.

- Separable Portion A – Ferrara Park Oval, Girrawheen
- Separable Portion B – Belhaven Park East Oval, Quinns Rocks
- Separable Portion C (Optional) – Belhaven Park West Oval, Quinns Rocks

Separable portions A and B offered two options for consideration, being 50 lux lighting level or 100 lux lighting level and Separable Portion C included 50 lux lighting only.

Essential details of the proposed contract are as follows:

Item	Detail
Contract Form	Minor Works
Contract Type	Lump Sum (Separable Portion)
Contract Duration	18 months (including defects liability period)
Commencement Date	July 2021
Expiry Date	12 months after Practical Completion
Extension Permitted	No
Rise and Fall	Not applicable

Tender submissions were received from the following companies:

Legal Name	Abbreviation
Ertech PL	Ertech
Future Power WA PL	Future Power
Gillmore Electrical Services PL	Gillmore
Hender Lee Electrical Contractors PL	Hender Lee
Insight Electrical Technology PL	Insight
Stiles Electrical & Communication Services PL	Stiles

The Tender Evaluation panel comprised:

- Senior Project Manager, Facilities Projects
- Acting Coordinator, Facilities Projects
- Planning Officer, Community Facilities
- Coordinator Safety Systems
- Consultant – Sage Consulting

Probity Oversight

The City's Contracts Officer undertook oversight of the tender assessment process.

Tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan (PEP) which included the following selection criteria:

Item No	Description	Weighting
1	Price (assessed under Value for Money)	Not Weighted
2	Sustainable Procurement a) Environmental Considerations 10% b) Buy Local 15% c) Reconciliation Action Plan 2.5% d) Disability Access & Inclusion 2.5%	30%
3	*Organisational & Key Personnel Experience	25%
4	*Methodology & Ability to Meet Project Timeline	25%
5	*OHS	20%

Pricing is not included in the qualitative criteria and is considered as part of the overall value for money assessment.

All tenderers must achieve a minimum acceptable qualitative score (as determined by the City) for each of the qualitative criteria detailed above (*) to be considered for further evaluation.

Conforming & Non-Conforming Tenders

All tender submissions received were conforming. Gillmore Electrical only submitted a price for Separable Portion A, Ferrara Park, Girrawheen. The remaining five (5) Tenderers submitted for all Separable Portions.

Evaluation Criteria 2 – Sustainable Procurement (30%)

Sub criteria a) Environmental Considerations (10%)

Assessment of this criterion considered the Tenderers credentials of any environmental claims of the goods and/or services being submitted in this Tender.

Tenderer	Ranking
Ertech	1
Hender Lee	1
Future Power	3
Gillmore	3
Insight	3
Stiles	6

Sub criteria b) Buy Local (Broader Economic Impact Implications for the City of Wanneroo) (15%)

This criterion assesses the commitment and engagement of the Tenderers to providing economic stimulation to local business.

Tenderer	Ranking
Ertech	1
Stiles	1
Gillmore	3
Hender Lee	4
Insight	5
Future Power	6

Sub criteria c) Reconciliation Action Plan (RAP) (2.5%)

Evaluation of this criterion assessed the Tenderers organisational commitment to City's Reconciliation Action Plan.

Tenderer	Ranking
Ertech	1
Future Power	2
Gillmore	2
Hender Lee	2
Insight	2
Stiles	2

Sub criteria d) Access & Inclusion Plan (AIP) (2.5%)

This criterion assesses the Tenderers commitment to engage people in the community with disabilities.

Tenderer	Ranking
Gillmore	1
Hender Lee	2
Ertech	3
Future Power	3
Insight	3
Stiles	6

The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following overall ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Ertech	1
Gillmore	2
Stiles	3
Hender Lee	4
Insight	5
Future Power	6

Evaluation Criteria 3 – Organisation and Key Personnel Experience (25%)

The Tenderers relevant organisational experience and the experience of proposed key personnel in demonstrating the achievement of meeting client expectations, as

presented in their tender submission, were assessed in order to evaluate their capability to meet the requirements of the contract.

Assessment of this criterion considered each Tenderer's credentials, project examples with similar scope and the identified personnel's capacity to meet the requirements of the contract.

The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Future Power	1
Gillmore	1
Hender Lee	1
Stiles	1
Insight	5
Ertech	6

All Tenderers achieved an acceptable minimum score for this criterion.

Evaluation Criteria 4 - Tenderer's Methodology and Project Timeframe (25%)

The Tenderers demonstrated methodology and construction program, presented in their tender submissions, were assessed in order to evaluate their understanding of the requirements of the tender documentation and their proposed resourcing to manage the contract.

Assessment of this criterion considered each Tenderer's proposed services, allocation of resourced, proposed Gantt / Construction Program schedule and methodology statement in relation to how the work will be undertaken.

The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Ertech	1
Future Power	1
Hender Lee	1
Stiles	1
Gillmore	5
Insight	5

All Tenderers achieved an acceptable minimum score for this criterion.

Evaluation Criteria 5 – Occupational Health and Safety (OHS) Management System (20%)

Evidence of safety management policies and practices were assessed from the tenderers submissions. The assessment for safety management was based on the Tenderers responses to an Occupational Health and Safety Management System Questionnaire included within the tender documentation.

All Tenderers provided details of their safety management systems with the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Ertech	1
Future Power	2
Gillmore	2
Stiles	2
Hender Lee	5
Insight	5

All Tenderers achieved an acceptable minimum score for this evaluation criterion.

Overall Qualitative Weighted Assessment and Ranking

The overall qualitative criteria weighted assessment resulted in the following Tenderer ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Ertech	1
Stiles	2
Hender Lee	3
Gillmore	4
Future Power	5
Insight	6

Tendered Lump Sum Price Ranking

The tenderers price submissions were reviewed and the attached Confidential Memo provides the detailed price information.

Prices were reviewed for both 50 and 100 lux options and it was determined that the 100 lux option for both parks exceeded the current allocated project budgets by over \$100,000.

Therefore, price comparisons were undertaken for both sites for the 50 lux options, Ferrara Park (Separable Portion A, Option A1) and Belhaven Park East (Separable Portion B, Option B1) and Belhaven Park West (Separable Portion C, Optional Item).

The price assessment for Ferrara Park (Separable Portion A, Option 1) resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Stiles	1
Gillmore	2
Ertech	3
Future Power	4
Insight	5
Hender Lee	6

The price assessment for Belhaven Park East oval (Separable Portion B, Option B1) resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Stiles	1
Future Power	2
Hender Lee	3
Ertech	4
Insight	5
Gillmore	Did not price this option

Separable Portion C for Belhaven Park West Oval was included in the evaluation as there is sufficient project budget to undertake this optional item portion of works. The price assessment resulted in the following ranking:

Tenderer	Ranking
Stiles	1
Hender Lee	2
Future Power	3
Ertech	4
Insight	5
Gillmore	Did not price this option

Value for Money Assessment

The evaluation of the tendered prices and the overall qualitative assessment resulted in the rankings for each separable portion as shown below. The Evaluation Panel recommends the award all Separable Portions to one contractor would yield the best value for money.

Ferrara Park, Girrawheen

The individual assessment of Price vs Qualitative Scores for Ferrara Park (Separable Portion A) resulted in the following tender ranking (highest to lowest):

Tenderer	Ranking
Stiles	1
Ertech	2
Gillmore	3
Future Power	4
Hender Lee	5
Insight	6

Belhaven Park (East Oval), Quinns Rocks

The individual assessment of Price vs Qualitative Scores for Belhaven Park East oval (Separable Portion B, Option B1) resulted in the following tender ranking (highest to lowest):

Tenderer	Ranking
Stiles	1
Future Power	2
Ertech	3

Hender Lee	4
Insight	5

Belhaven Park (West Oval), Quinns Rocks

The individual assessment of Price vs Qualitative Scores for Belhaven Park West oval (Separable Portion C) resulted in the following tender ranking (highest to lowest):

Tenderer	Ranking
Stiles	1
Future Power	2
Ertech	3
Hender Lee	4
Insight	5

Overall Assessment and Comment

The tender submission from Stiles Electrical and Communication PL achieved the highest value for money ranking for Ferrara Park & Belhaven Park (East and West Ovals) and satisfied the qualitative assessment in accordance with the assessment criteria and weightings as detailed in the Procurement and Evaluation Plan.

Stiles Electrical is therefore recommended as the successful Tenderer for both Ferrara Park oval (Separable Portion A, Option1) and Belhaven Park oval (Separable Portion B, Option 1 and Separable Portion C).

The assessment and evaluation of Stiles' tender submission also noted the following:

- Stiles' tender price is highly competitive and is within the project budget;
- Stiles has indicated within their tender a strong and large team, capable of successfully delivering this type of a project;
- Stiles has performed a number of sports floodlighting projects within the City of Wanneroo, similar Local Government organisations, and the Perth metropolitan area using LED technology;
- Stiles have demonstrated safety systems in place which meet the City's Occupational Health and Safety Management System assessment requirements; and
- Previous works undertaken for the City, including Hainsworth and Koondoola floodlighting upgrades were successful.

Consultation

Consultation with the City's internal stakeholders has been undertaken throughout the design process to ensure that requirements are met.

As per the City's Community Engagement Plan, consultation was undertaken for both floodlighting projects including a four-week public comment period, which concluded on 28 February 2021 for Ferrara Park and 14 February 2021 for Belhaven Park.

During the public comment period, the City received only two responses for Ferrara Park querying light spill to neighbouring properties. Community Facilities Planning responded to these queries and confirmed that the lighting layout had been designed to control light spill to surrounding properties and that design calculations for Ferrara

Park lighting is compliant with the minimum allowable spill light levels required by the Australian Standards.

Belhaven Park received one positive feedback, two responses requesting further information about the lighting design and two responses querying light spill to neighbouring properties. Community Facilities Planning responded to these queries and provided the relevant information and confirmed that the lighting design has been undertaken to minimise light spill and meets the requirements under the Australian Standards. It was also mentioned that the floodlights will only be activated when the field is in use. Quinns Beach Primary school was consulted during the floodlighting design stage for Belhaven Park. Community engagement will continue throughout construction stage of the project, with a particular focus on minimising the impact on site and maintaining a safe work environment.

Statutory Compliance

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.57 of the *Local Government Act 1995*. The tendering procedures and evaluation complied with the requirements of Part 4 of the *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996*.

As confirmed with the City's Approval Services, the WA Department of Planning, Lands and Heritage confirms that a Development Approval is not required for the installation of sports floodlighting at the aforementioned parks. As confirmed with the City's Approval Services a building permit application will need to be submitted by the electrical contractors as part of their scope of works.

Strategic Implications

The proposal aligns with the following objectives with the Strategic Community Plan 2021 – 2031:

Goal 1: An inclusive and accessible City with places and spaces that embrace all

Priority 1.3 – Facilities and activities for all

Goal 5: A well-planned, safe and resilient City that is easy to travel around and provides a connection between people and places

Priority 5.4 – People feel safe in public places

Enterprise Risk Management Considerations

Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-O20 Productive Communities	Moderate
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Community & Place	Manage
Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-O23 Safety of Community	Low
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Community and Place	Manage

The above risks relating to the issues contained within this report have been identified and considered within the City's corporate risk register. Action plans have been developed to manage these risks to improve the existing management systems.

Financial and Performance Risk

Financial Risk

A financial risk assessment was undertaken as part of the tender evaluation process and the outcome of this independent check advised that Stiles Electrical has been assessed with a 'sound' financial capacity to meet the requirements of the contract. Security will be provided by the Contractor for all three portions of works.

Performance Risk

Stiles Electrical has carried out several floodlighting projects for the City in the past, recently for Ridgewood Park with similar complexity and value.

Policy Implications

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of the City's Purchasing Policy.

Financial (Budget) Implications

Ferrara Park, Girrawheen

The table below summarises the available funding for the project, commitments and the recommended tender price by **Stiles Electrical** for the Provision of Minor Works for the supply, installation and commissioning of floodlighting at Ferrara Park, Girrawheen and associated expenses:

PR-4213 PMO19091 Ferrara Park Girrawheen Upgrade Sports Floodlighting		
Description	Expenditure	Budget
Budget:		
Allocated Capital Works Budget for 2021/22 (project construction on hold during 20/21 due to COVID-19 budget restrictions)		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Municipal Funds 		\$228,781
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CSRFF Grant Fund (Community Sporting and Recreation Facilities Fund) 		\$114,219
Allocated Capital Works Budget for Main Switchboard Upgrades PR-1661		\$18,000
Expenditure:		
Project Management Fees	\$14,104	
Professional Fees (uncommitted)	\$2,000	
RFT21106 Separable Portion A1 – Supply, installation and Commissioning of 50 lux LED floodlighting at Ferrara Park, Girrawheen	\$329,809.21	
Construction Contingency (general)	\$15,086	
Total Expenditure	\$360,999.21	
Total Funding in 2021/2022		\$361,000

Belhaven Park, Quinns Rocks

The table below summarises the available funding for the project, commitments and the recommended tender price by **Stiles Electrical** for the Provision of Minor Works for the supply, installation and commissioning of floodlighting at Belhaven Park (East and West Ovals), Quinns Rocks and associated expenses:

PR-4253 PMO20032 Belhaven Park Quinns Rocks Upgrade Sports Floodlighting (ARMP)

Description	Expenditure	Budget
Budget:		
Allocated Budget for 2021/22 – LRCIP (Local Roads and Community Infrastructure Program) Grant		\$335,700
Expenditure:		
Commitment to date	\$2,966	
Project Management Fees	\$20,000	
Professional Fees (uncommitted)	\$3,500	
RFT21106 Separable Portion B1 – Supply, installation and Commissioning of 50 lux LED floodlighting at Belhaven Park (East Oval), Quinns Rocks	\$200,163.16	
RFT21106 Separable Portion C (Optional) – Supply, installation and Commissioning of 50 lux LED floodlighting at Belhaven Park (West Oval), Quinns Rocks	\$88,364.36	
Construction Contingency (for rock excavation & general)	\$20,705	
Total Expenditure	\$335,698.52	
Total Funding		\$335,700

Recommendation:

That the Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.14 - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register for the awarding of tenders:

1. **ACCEPTS** the tender submitted by Stiles Electrical & Communication Services PL for Tender 21106 for the Supply, Installation and Commissioning of floodlighting at Ferrara Park, Girrawheen for Separable Portion A, Option A1 as a Fixed Lump Sum Price of \$329,809.21 (excl. GST);
2. **ACCEPTS** the tender submitted by Stiles Electrical & Communication Services PL for Tender 21106 for the Supply, Installation and Commissioning of floodlighting at Belhaven Park (East Oval), Quinns Rocks for Separable Portion B Option B1 as a Fixed Lump Sum Price of \$200,163.16 (excl. GST); and

- 3. ACCEPTS the tender submitted by Stiles Electrical & Communication Services PL for Tender 21106 for the Supply, Installation and Commissioning of floodlighting at Belhaven Park (West Oval), Quinns Rocks for Separable Portion C as a Fixed Lump Sum Price of \$88,364.36 (excl. GST), in accordance with the terms and conditions specified in the tender document.**