

## **TENDER RECOMMENDATION REPORT**

**TO:** CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

**CC:** MANAGER INFRASTRUCTURE CAPITAL WORKS  
ACTING COORDINATOR CONSTRUCTION

**FROM:** DIRECTOR ASSETS

**FILE REF:** 24/339621

**DATE:** 25 September 2024

### **TENDER NUMBER 24078 - SUPPLY AND INSTALLATION OF FOOTPATH LIGHTING AT BRAMPTON PARK, BUTLER AND LIGHTHOUSE PARK, MINDARIE**

#### **Issue**

To consider Tender No: 24078 for the provision of minor works to Supply and Install Footpath Lighting at Brampton Park, Butler and Lighthouse Park, Mindarie, park lighting upgrades.

#### **Background**

The park asset renewal program is a program focused on aligning parks and their assets which are approaching the end of their asset life. Part of the program focuses on the renewal of park lighting ensuring that the parks compliance with the POS Policy is improved. Brampton Park and Lighthouse Park have been listed for lighting upgrade to improve the existing infrastructure.

Tender 24078 included each park as a separable portion, which allowed Tenderers to submit tenders for each park separately and gave the City an opportunity to award each park separately or collectively where best value for money was offered.

#### **Detail**

Tender 24078 for the Supply and Installation of Footpath Lighting at Brampton Park and Lighthouse Park was advertised on 13 July 2024 and closed on 13 August 2024. No Addenda were issued.

Essential details of the proposed contract are as follows:

<b>Item</b>	<b>Detail</b>
Contract Form	Minor Works
Contract Type	Fixed Lump Sum in separable portions
Contract Duration	4 months
Commencement Date	October 2024
Expiry Date	February 2025(excluding DLP)
Extension Permitted	No

Tender submissions were received from the following companies:

Legal Name	Trading Name	Abbreviation
Stiles Electrical & Communication Services Pty Ltd	Stiles Electrical	Stiles Electrical
The Fauntleroy Family Trust & The Mihevc Family Trust t/as Boyan Electrical Services	Boyan Electrical Services	Boyan Electrical

### Probity Oversight

Oversight to the tender assessment process was undertaken by the City's Contracts Officer.

Tender submissions were evaluated in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan (**PEP**) which included the following selection criteria:

Item No	Description	Weighting
1	Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement a) Environmental Considerations 5% b) Buy Local 10% c) Reconciliation Action Plan 5% d) Access and Inclusion 5%	25%
2	*Work Health & Safety (WHS)	20%
3	* Demonstrated Understanding and Methodology	25%
4	*Demonstrated Experience, Capacity and Resources	30%

All Tenderers must meet the City's minimum requirements (as determined by the City) for each of the qualitative criteria detailed above (\*) to be considered for further evaluation.

Pricing is not included in the qualitative criteria and is considered as part of the overall value for money assessment.

Both submissions received were deemed conforming offers and proceeded for further evaluation.

### Evaluation Criteria 1 – Sustainable Procurement (25%)

Evidence of Sustainable (Corporate Social Responsibility) Procurement was assessed based on the Tenderer's responses provided to the Questionnaires within Schedules 3A, 3B, 3C and 3D which formed part of the tender documentation.

**Sub Criteria a) Environmental Considerations (5%)**

The City is committed to procuring goods and services that provide positive environmental, social and economic impacts over the entire life cycle of a product or service. Respondents are encouraged to provide credentials of any environmental claims of the goods and/or services submitted in this tender.

Tenderers provided details of their environmental considerations within Schedule 3A, with the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Boyan Electrical	2

**Sub Criteria b) Buy Local (10%)**

An assessment was made based on the response provided, detailing the following information:

- Location of tenderer’s offices and workshops;
- Residential addresses of staff and company addresses of subcontractors;
- Purchasing arrangements through local businesses;
- Requirement for new employees arising from award of the contract.

Tenderers provided details of their “Buy Local” considerations within Schedule 3B, with the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Boyan Electrical	2

**Sub Criteria c) Reconciliation Action Plan (RAP) (5%)**

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to:

- RELATIONSHIPS - building positive relationships between indigenous and non-indigenous people;
- RESPECT – recognising the contribution of Indigenous people to Australia and learning more about the history, culture and diversity in a two-way communication process;
- OPPORTUNITIES – attracting, developing and retaining organisational talent to build opportunities for aboriginal employment, training, and development and mentoring.

Tenderers provided information specifying differing levels of actions in relation to indigenous reconciliation action with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Boyan Electrical	1

**Sub Criteria d) Access & Inclusion Plan (AIP) (5%)**

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the responses provided that relate to:

- People with disabilities having the same buildings and facilities access opportunities as other people;
- People with disabilities receiving information in a format that will enable them to access information as readily as other people are able to access it;
- People with disabilities receiving the same level and quality of service from staff as other people receive;
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to make complaints;
- People with disabilities having the same opportunities as other people to participate in any employment opportunities.

Tenderers provided information specifying considerations for access and inclusion provisions with assessment resulting in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Boyan Electrical	1
Stiles Electrical	2

### **Overall Sustainable Procurement Ranking Summary**

The overall assessment of the Sustainable Procurement criteria has resulted in the following overall ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical Services	1
Boyan Electrical	2

### **Evaluation Criteria 2 - Tenderer’s Safety Management Systems (20%)**

Evidence of WHS management policies and practices was assessed from the tender submissions. The assessment for safety management was based on the tenderer’s responses to a specific questionnaire included within the tender documentation.

Tenderers provided details of their safety management systems with the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Boyan Electrical	1
Stiles Electrical	2

### **Evaluation Criteria 3 - Demonstrated Understanding and Methodology (25%)**

The tenderer’s understanding of the project requirements and their methodology to achieve successful delivery as presented in their tender submission were assessed to evaluate their capacity to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tenderer’s understanding of the sites, project planning and construction methodology to manage the contract.

The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Boyan Electrical	2

#### **Evaluation Criteria 4 - Demonstrated Experience, Capacity and Resources (30%)**

The tenderer's relevant experience in demonstrating the achievement of meeting client expectations as presented in their tender submission were assessed to evaluate their capability to meet the requirements of the contract. Assessment of this criterion considered the tendering entity's credentials to fulfil the requirements of the contract as well as the tenderer's staff resources, vehicles and plant/equipment.

The assessment of this criterion has resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Boyan Electrical	2

#### **Overall Qualitative Weighted Assessment and Ranking**

Tenderer's submissions were reviewed in accordance with the Procurement and Evaluation Plan. The overall assessment of qualitative weighted criteria resulted in the following ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Boyan Electrical	2

#### **Pricing for the Works Offered**

An assessment was made to determine the ranking based on the lump sum pricing (combined separable portions 1 and 2) provided with the tender documentation.

Based on the information provided, tenderers are ranked as follows:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Boyan Electrical	2

#### **Relative Value for Money Assessment**

The combined assessment of lump sum price and qualitative criteria resulted in the following tenderer ranking:

<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Stiles Electrical	1
Boyan Electrical	2

### Overall Assessment and Comment

The tender submission from Stiles Electrical satisfied the overall value for money assessment in accordance with the assessment criteria and weightings as detailed in the Procurement & Evaluation Plan.

Stiles Electrical achieved the highest overall qualitative weighted score and offered the lowest lump sum cost for both parks combined and is therefore recommended as the successful tenderer.

### Consultation

Community consultation will be completed in accordance with the City’s Community Engagement procedures relating to minor construction works.

Prior to construction, stakeholders will be notified of the upcoming on-site works and an information letter will be delivered to all residents adjacent to the relevant park.

### Statutory Compliance

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.57 of the *Local Government Act 1995*. The tendering procedures and evaluation complied with the requirements of Part 4 of the *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996*.

### Strategic Implications

The proposal aligns with the following objective with the Strategic Community Plan 2021-2031:

“Goal 5 A well planned safe and resilient City that is easy to travel around and provides a connection between people and places

### Risk Appetite Statement

In pursuit of strategic objective goal 5, we will accept a Medium level of risk, extended to High in the areas of Community / Reputation & Financial / Commercial impacts. Shifting transport modes and usage in the City may require short term pain for longer term gain as the City supports the development, maintenance, and connection of alternatives to car use (e.g. cycle ways) and the supporting infrastructure.

### Enterprise Risk Management Considerations

Risk Title	Risk Rating
ST-S20 Strategic Community Plan	Low
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Corporate Strategy & Performance	Manage

Risk Title	Risk Rating
CO-023 Safety of Community	Medium
Accountability	Action Planning Option
Director Community & Place	Manage

### Financial and Performance Risk

#### Financial Risk

A financial risk assessment was undertaken by Equifax Australasia Credit Ratings Pty Ltd as part of the tender evaluation process and the outcome of this independent

assessment advised that Stiles Electrical is assessed with the financial capacity to meet the requirements of the contract.

Performance Risk

Stiles Electrical has undertaken multiple capital works projects for the City. Over the past few financial years, the City worked with Stiles Electrical to successfully deliver capital works projects of a similar nature, in which they demonstrated satisfactory performance and achieved a high standard of works.

**Policy Implications**

Tenders were invited in accordance with the requirements of the City’s Purchasing Policy.

**Financial (Budget) Implications**

The table below summarises the available funding for the supply and installation of footpath lighting, as well as associated expenditure at Brampton Park, Butler and Lighthouse Park, Mindarie.

Description	Expenditure	Budget
<b>Budget:</b>		
Allocated Capital Works Budget for 2024/25 (PR-4414)		\$348,996
Allocated Capital Works Budget for 2024/25 (PR-4416)		\$399,097
<b>Expenditure:</b>		
Expenditure incurred to date	\$5,288	
Commitment to date	\$0	
Project management and professional fees	\$20,000	
Tender 24078 (this Tender)	\$657,225.04	
Construction Contingency	\$65,580	
<b>Total Expenditure</b>	<b>\$748,093</b>	
<b>Total Funding</b>		<b>\$748,093</b>

**Recommendation:**

**That the CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER, in accordance with Delegation 1.1.13 - Choice of Most Advantageous Tender of the Delegated Authority Register for the awarding of tenders, ACCEPTS the tender submitted by Stiles Electrical and Communication Services Pty Ltd for Tender 24078, for the Supply and Installation of Footpath Lighting at Brampton Park, Butler and Lighthouse Park, Mindarie, as per the fixed lump sum price of \$657,225.04.**